Effective Literacy Instruction for Multilingual Learners: What it is and What it Looks Like

U.S. Department of Education

September 21, 2022
Presenters

Maha Abdelkader
Education Program Specialist, OELA

Laurie Olsen
Strategic Advisor
Sobrato Early Academic Language

Kathy Escamilla
Professor Emerita
University of Colorado

Bitnara Jasmine Park
Senior Researcher
American Institutes for Research
Agenda

1. Welcome and Context
2. AIR NAEP Linking Study
3. Characteristics and Components of Effective Literacy Instruction for English Learners
4. Panel Discussion
5. Q & A
6. Resources
Background
Trend in Grade 4 Reading Average Scale Scores for ELs and Non-ELs: School Years 1998–2019

What Does National Data Tell Us About Early Reading Development?

B. Jasmine Park, PhD Senior Researcher
Mengyi Li, PhD | Xiaying Zheng, PhD | Yuan Zhang, PhD

OELA Webinar | September 21, 2022
Purpose of the Study

• Explore the importance of early reading development for future reading performance

• Opportunity to link two national large-scale datasets to further examine how early reading skills are related to NAEP grade 4 reading assessment performance

• Research Questions:
  – Do distinct patterns of reading growth exist?
  – If so, how are these related to students’ contextual information?
  – How are early reading growth development patterns related to students’ performance on the NAEP grade 4 reading assessment?
Data Source

- Early Childhood Longitudinal Study, Kindergarten Class of 2010-11 (ECLS-K:2011): A nationally representative sample of kindergarteners (2010-2011 school year) was followed to fifth grade.

- Data collection: from 2010-11 school year to 2015-16 school year

- One-on-one assessments of cognitive skills and knowledge including reading

- Overall reading score is based on measures of a variety of reading skills:
  - Phonemic awareness, beginning & ending sound, rhyming words
  - Letter recognition, print familiarity
  - Phonics, word recognition, sight words
  - Vocabulary
  - Comprehension

- Scores are calculated using Item Response Theory (IRT) and are vertically scaled.

- Contextual questionnaires administered to parents, teachers, and school administrators covering child’s learning experiences and environment at home and school; rating of child’s learning behaviors; instructional practices for class, etc.
Piecewise Latent Growth Model Results

Reading Growth from Kindergarten to Grade 3

Growth Mixture Model Results: Growth Trajectories

Understanding **NAEP Achievement Levels**

- **NAEP Proficient**: Represents *solid academic performance* for each NAEP assessment. Students reaching this level have demonstrated competency over challenging subject matter, including subject-matter knowledge, application of such knowledge to real world situations, and analytical skills appropriate to the subject matter.

- **NAEP Basic**: Denotes *partial mastery of prerequisite knowledge and skills* that are fundamental for performance at the *NAEP Proficient* level.

- More information about **NAEP Achievement Levels**: [NAEP Item Maps](#)
# Reading Growth Trajectory Patterns & NAEP Reading Achievement Levels

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>2015 G4 National Public (%)</th>
<th>High Performers (%)</th>
<th>Early Boosters (%)</th>
<th>Average Learners (%)</th>
<th>Steady but Slow Learners (%)</th>
<th>Struggling Learners (%)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>below NAEP Basic</td>
<td>32</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>10</td>
<td>30</td>
<td>64</td>
<td>95</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>At NAEP Basic</td>
<td>33</td>
<td>18</td>
<td>28</td>
<td>40</td>
<td>29</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>At NAEP Proficient</td>
<td>27</td>
<td>51</td>
<td>43</td>
<td>25</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>At NAEP Advanced</td>
<td>8</td>
<td>28</td>
<td>18</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

- One-third of Average Learners are projected to perform at *NAEP Proficient* or above.
- Almost all High Performers (8 out of 10) and Early Boosters (6 out of 10) are projected to perform at *NAEP Proficient* or above.
- Almost all Steady but Slow Learners (6 out of 10) and Struggling Learners (9 out of 10) are projected to perform below *NAEP Basic*.

1 Interpret data with caution.

NOTE: Columns add up to totals. Detail may not sum to totals because of rounding.

Reading Development and English Learners (EL)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Category</th>
<th>High Performers</th>
<th>Early Boosters</th>
<th>Average Learners</th>
<th>Steady but Slow Learners</th>
<th>Struggling Learners</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>All</td>
<td>2%</td>
<td>20%</td>
<td>52%</td>
<td>20%</td>
<td>3%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Native English Speaker</td>
<td>6%</td>
<td>21%</td>
<td>54%</td>
<td>17%</td>
<td>2%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>EL</td>
<td>1%</td>
<td>6%</td>
<td>44%</td>
<td>38%</td>
<td>11%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Interpret data with caution.


1 Interpret data with caution.
Making Progress, but is it Enough?

What Students Can Do

- Steady but Slow Learners and Struggling Learners are more likely to begin kindergarten with lower reading skills.
- By the end of first grade, most students acquired foundational reading skills, but Struggling Learners demonstrated challenges with phonological awareness.
- By the end of second grade, almost all students seemed to acquire foundational skills necessary for decoding.
- English learners in general began kindergarten with lower reading skills.
- By the end of first grade, most EL students acquired alphabetic principle skills.
- By the end of second grade, most EL students acquired phonological awareness skills.
Teachers’ Reporting of Instructional Practices

• No differences on most reading-related instruction variables regardless of students’ reading development patterns or EL status

• Some differences observed in spring of kindergarten & first grade
  – Kindergarten:
    » Reading aloud and reading books of their own choice as a class activity: Higher for Average Learners compared to Steady but Slow Learners and Struggling Learners
    » Discussing new or difficult vocabulary and retelling stories: Higher for Steady but Slow Learners and Struggling Learners compared to Average Learners
  – First Grade
    » Teaching comprehension strategies: Higher for Average Learners compared to Steady but Slow Learners and Struggling Learners
    » Teaching phonics and word recognition: Higher for Steady but Slow Learners and Struggling Learners compared to Average Learners
What Did We Learn about Early Reading Development?

• Nationally, data show that all children gain reading skills over time, but not everyone makes adequate growth in reading which widens reading skill gap.

• Mastering foundational reading skills in early grades is important, and most students, including English learners, seem to acquire sufficient foundational reading skills by the end of second grade.

• Building strong foundational reading skills is important but not sufficient for students’ overall reading and literacy development.
Resources and More Information about NAEP

- Promising Practices to Support English Learners
- Effective Literacy and English Language Instruction for English Learners in Elementary Grades
- AIR’s work on NAEP
- The Nation’s Report Card
• 1 in 10 students nationwide have a home language other than English and are learning English as a second language (English language learners/Bilingual learners/Dual language learners)

• English language learners have been the recipients of many “reforms” but research about them is rarely built upon when literacy reforms are created and implemented

• Outcomes have been disappointing. Gaps maintained.

• We HAVE a strong research base upon which to build effective literacy approaches for ELLs
A Narrowed View of Becoming Literate

In ENGLISH
Same as monolingual English speakers
1974: Lau v. Nichols Supreme Court Decision

“There is no equality of treatment merely by providing students with the same facilities, textbooks, teachers and curriculum…for students who do not understand English are effectively foreclosed from any meaningful education…”

Lau v. Nichols, Supreme Court
The five National Reading Panel components of reading instruction are not sufficient for ELLs.

Second language development and literacy development is different from monolingual.

ESL/ELD is important component.

Important role of home language, cross-language interactions.

Viability of dual language approaches.

Oral language as foundation for literacy.

Integration of the four domains of language.

Key role of meaning-making and comprehension.

“to extend and adjust the findings of the National Reading Panel”

Continuing Research to Build a Science of Literacy Development for English Learners and Bilingual Children and Youth

- Dual language development in the early years 0–8
- Neuroscience and the bilingual brain
- Benefits of bilingualism
- Translanguaging
- Differentiated and responsive services needed for different population of ELLs
- Dangers of language loss
- Effective practices and program design

See handout of key research
Language processing in the bilingual mind differs from the monolingual mind. The development of literacy for a dual language brain is not the same as for a monolingual brain. The new language and literacy system is developed in the presence of and in interaction with an existing language system.

One Brain – Two Languages

See Handout on “Differences”
Goals of Literacy Education for ELLs

- Educational access, participation and success
- Literacy for *all* of their language and cultural worlds
- Read, comprehend, and access books for information, academic engagement, entertainment, wisdom, the stories of other people and places and worlds
- Voice and expression – writing as well as reading
What is an effective literacy approach for ELLs that is based upon research about them, embraces the dual language brain as a reality and as an asset in literacy development, and has been demonstrated to have positive impacts?
Effective Literacy Model for ELLs

- Comprehensive
- Multi-dimensional
- Complex
- Interactive and interactional
- Integrated
- Equitable
- Responsive
- Based upon multi-disciplinary research based on ELLs and dual language/2nd language

“YES!”
### Effective Literacy Model for English Learners

**Precursor Skills**

- (preschool)
  - Essential Elements of Literacy Instruction
  - Essential Contexts for Effective Literacy Development

**Essential Elements of Literacy Instruction (K+)**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Foundational Skills</th>
<th>Essential Literacy Components</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>- Phonemic Awareness</td>
<td>- Oral language development</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- Letter knowledge and alphabet</td>
<td>- Vocabulary (and background knowledge) across content areas</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- Phonics and Decoding (word recognition)</td>
<td>- Comprehension and meaning-making</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- Concepts of print</td>
<td>- Cross language connections &amp; Metalinguistic Development</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- Fluency</td>
<td>- Writing</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Essential Literacy Components**

- Oral language development
- Vocabulary (and background knowledge) across content areas
- Comprehension and meaning-making
- Cross language connections & Metalinguistic Development
- Writing
- Print immersion/access and Active Engagement with Text

**Essential Contexts for Effective Literacy Development**

- English language development: How English works (for ELs)
- Integrated Content knowledge and Language/Literacy through thematic instruction
- Language-rich, print-immersive and content-rich learning environment
- High quality and culturally inclusive relevant materials
- Safe and affirming assets-based relationships and classroom/school cultures
- Embrace of home language and affirmation of bilingualism (for ELs)
- Differentiated instruction based on formative assessments

**In a DUAL LANGUAGE/BILITERACY PROGRAM Context**

- Explicit goal of biliteracy
- Native language foundational skills
- Strategic and aligned literacy instruction across two languages
- Cross-language, transfer, metalinguistic skills
- Dual language assessments
- Use of literacy for and in academic study in both languages

See Handout pg. 2

---

**PRECURSOR Skills and Conditions**

(for 3 and 4 year olds, some 5 year olds →, in both home language and English)

- Oral language and vocabulary development
- Phonological awareness
- Memory and visual recall
- Print access and active engagement with books and text
- Early concepts of print and purposes of print (written and read)
- Early attentiveness to print, beginning letter knowledge

---

**See Handout pg. 2**
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Component</th>
<th>If not present...</th>
<th>Notes re: ELLs</th>
<th>Examples: What you see...</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Oral language</td>
<td>Without development of oral language that is the foundation for internalizing a language, ELLs will struggle to isolate and hear the sounds of the language needed to decode text, are challenged in recognizing vocabulary in print, and have more difficulty following the flow and structure and meaning of text.</td>
<td>Building oral language is both an ESL/ELD second language issue, and a matter of building opportunities and structures for student talk/discourse into all curriculum for all students. It is how ELLs internalize the sounds, structures and vocabulary in English</td>
<td>High degree of student talk and oral engagement Structured &amp; scaffolded opportunities for student talk – with particular support for ELLs (e.g., sentence starters, modeling, T-P-S)</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Effective Literacy Model for ELLs

• Each element is important and has a specific role to play in overall literacy development
• All elements must be present and addressed
• The elements work together and interact
• No element alone or in isolation is sufficient
• No element has primacy or priority over another; none is more important than any other
• No single approach works optimally for all students – effective literacy instruction is responsive and differentiated
EFFECTIVE DUAL LANGUAGE LITERACY INSTRUCTION IN BILITERACY SETTINGS
Towards a Biliterate Pedagogy: Biliteracy Development

• Effective teaching in biliteracy contexts requires a **biliterate pedagogy**.

• The key to developing effective biliteracy programs is **not** finding a **single program** that works for all children in all localities, but in implementing a set of **program components** that works for the children in the community of interest, given that community’s goals, demographics, and target languages.

• Bilingualism is not the presence of two separate language systems and identities; it involves the **intersection** of two (or more) languages within the mind and life experiences of an individual. Biliteracy pedagogy must acknowledge and include this linguistic intersection.

• It is time to move beyond debates about language(s) of instruction to discussions about quality of instruction.

• Biliteracy programs boost self-esteem, and cultural pride and teach for social justice.
Biliterate Pedagogies…

- Provide strategic and aligned literacy instruction across two languages
- Go beyond teaching two languages.
- Intentionally connect language environments
- Provide explicit opportunities for students to make cross-language and cross-cultural connections
- Utilize dual language assessments
- Use literacy for and in academic study in both languages
One Example of a Research-based and Research–Tested Biliteracy Approach

BILITERACY IN ACTION: LITERACY SQUARED®

Literacy Squared®: Biliteracy Framework

Phonics has an important and strategic role in biliteracy.
• A Literacy Squared strategy
• Culturally relevant – adapted from Central and South America
• Explicit and direct
• Connected discourse
• An **integrated** biliterate strategy that includes:
  – Language arts (one week Spanish/one week English)
  – Content based
  – Cross-language connections
  – Metalinguistic development

• **Meaning making is everything!**
La erosión
La erosión es el desgaste de la Tierra. Hay erosión por la lluvia, tormenta de hielo, viento, y excavación de las montañas.
The Dictado: 2nd grade Bilingual Classroom

Video can be found here: https://vimeo.com/754432086/1ae3f91595
Transfer

Integration/syncing
• The C6 Biliteracy Framework – José Medina
  – https://ellevationeducation.com/blog/biliteracy-framework

• Center for Teaching for Biliteracy – Karen Beeman & Cheryl Urow
  – https://www.teachingforbiliteracy.com

• TaJu Solutions – Alejandra Guilamo
  – https://tajulearning.com

• Literacy Squared® - Susan Hopewell, Jody Slavick & Kathy Escamilla
  – https://www.literacysquared.org
Why Aren’t Monolingual Theories/Pedagogies Sufficient?

• Tandem bicycle vs. riding solo

• Imagine starting out learning to ride a bike, but with the caveat that you must do so while coordinating with another person.

• The process itself (mounting, balancing, coordinating & communicating) would be substantially different than learning to ride solo.

• Much about riding a bike solo (pedaling, steering, etc.) overlaps with what one needs to understand about riding tandem

• But the effect of two riders changes the experience in meaningful ways.

• Biliterate pedagogy proposes that the effect of two languages changes the language acquisition and academic learning process in meaningful ways.
EFFECTIVE LITERACY FOR ENGLISH LANGUAGE LEARNERS IN ENGLISH INSTRUCTION

(where the vast majority of ELLs are receiving literacy instruction)
Reminder of Elements of Comprehensive Model

**ESSENTIAL ELEMENTS**
- Phonemic Awareness
- Letter knowledge/Alphabetics
- Phonics, Decoding, Word Work
- Concepts of Print
- Fluency
- Oral language
- Vocabulary & background knowledge
- Comprehension/meaning making
- Cross language connections
- Writing

**ESSENTIAL CONTEXTS**
- Print access
- ELD/ESL –How English Works
- Integrated language, literacy, content
- Language and print-rich environment
- Culturally inclusive materials
- Affirming, assets-based climate
- Differentiation, valid assessment
- Embrace of home language and bilingualism
Effective Literacy Instruction in an English Taught Context Requires.....

- The building of the new LANGUAGE has to be explicit
- The leveraging of home language has to be intentional
- The language barrier to participation has to be overcome
• Second language pedagogy builds the new language and recognizes & leverages the dual language brain
• ESL/ELD - essential partner to literacy instruction
• “Scaffolding” strategies facilitate comprehension, participation, engagement
• Literacy and language development integrated with content – throughout day
• Messaging and support for home language literacy, and exposure to literature reflecting home culture and language
• Partnering with & embracing family role
VIDEO: Preschool – *(precursors to literacy)*

Video can be found here: https://vimeo.com/754431590/dabdc46ef3
What it Looks Like: (Did you notice...?)

- The role of print in the environment
- Integration of early foundational literacy skills and writing with content
- Role of oral language as a bridge to and foundation for literacy
- Use of small groups (by interest, readiness)

See Handout of SEAL Video Resources
www.seal.org
GUARD AGAINST THESE TENDENCIES

• Invisibility or Marginalization of ELLs
• Rush to intervention based upon monolingual & inadequate assessments
• Push down
• Push out of content to focus on literacy
• English-only or English-centric
• Narrowing of literacy to discrete reading skills
• Minimizing role of responsive teaching
• One-size-fits-all solutions
• Deficit perspectives
Implications for Leadership

- Curriculum materials focus on *all* essential elements
- Quality ELD (ESL) as part of literacy education
- Observations, monitoring and assessments focus on all essential elements of literacy instruction, literacy environments and skill development for ELLs
- Investments in classroom libraries of high quality multiple-genre and multiple language books and print materials to create print-rich and content-rich classroom environments for literacy and learning
- Literacy coaches and collaborative time for teachers to plan integrated language/literacy/content curriculum
- Invest in professional learning for all teachers re: ELLs and effective literacy
- Message the value of biliteracy
- Expand dual language and biliteracy programs
We cannot afford to lose another generation to literacy programs that aren’t designed or delivered based on what we KNOW is needed for them, or to relegate them to ineffective instructional approaches that once again, will leave them behind.
Thank You!
For more information visit:
www.MultiLingualLiteracy.org
Panel Reflections
Panelists

Aloise Miller
Adjunct Presenter
Seidlitz Education

Lillie Ruvalcaba
English Learner Teacher
Mountain View School District 32

Ana DeGenna
Associate Superintendent of Educational Services
Oxnard School District
Panel Reflections

Ana DeGenna
Associate Superintendent of Educational Services
Oxnard School District

Question 1: What program models are used in your district? What are some of the similarities and differences in how literacy is taught in your bilingual/dual language settings and what that looks like for multilingual learners in your English only settings?

Question 2: We know you have adopted multiple models of bilingual programs in order to accommodate specific demographics and staff capacity. What structures are in place across the district to ensure a consistent approach to literacy development while allowing each school flexibility?
Question 1: What advice do you have for teachers to approach literacy instruction for multilingual learners, what are ways to draw on their strengths, including their oral language, home language, and content knowledge?

Question 2: How do you support teachers with different backgrounds? Are there different literacy-coaching strategies in bilingual and English-only settings, or with novice and more experienced teachers?
Panel Reflections

Question 1: What are effective ways of planning literacy instruction for multilingual learners that is engaging, builds on oral language, and integrates with content?

Question 2: What have been some of the important learning experiences for you in growing as a literacy teacher, including things that you’ve learned in professional development and new approaches you have tried in the classroom? What changes have you seen in your students as a result of implementing what you’ve learned?
Disclaimer

This webinar contains examples and resource materials that are provided for the user’s convenience. The inclusion of any material is not intended to reflect its importance, nor is it intended to endorse any views expressed or products or services offered. These materials may contain the views and recommendations of various subject matter experts as well as hypertext links, contact addresses, and websites to information created and maintained by other public and private organizations. The opinions expressed in any of these materials do not necessarily reflect the positions or policies of the U.S. Department of Education. The U.S. Department of Education does not control or guarantee the accuracy, relevance, timeliness, or completeness of any outside information included in these materials. Mentions of specific programs or products in these examples are designed to provide clearer understanding and are not meant as endorsements.
Q & A, Resources, Feedback
New OELA Resources

**NCELA Website:** [https://ncela.ed.gov/](https://ncela.ed.gov/)

**Infographic:** Heritage Language Learners and American Indian Alaska Native Students

**Infographic:** Addressing the Impact of COVID-19 on Multilingual Learners and Their Social and Emotional Well-Being

**Fact Sheet:** English Learners in College Credit-Bearing Courses

**Fact Sheet:** English Learners: Demographic Trends

**OELA Podcast:** English Learners in Secondary Schools: Trajectories, Transitions, and Promising Practices (Two-Part Podcast)

**OELA Podcast (Coming Soon!!!):** Implementing Evidence-Based Instructional Practices for English Learners (Two-Part Podcast)
Certificate of Completion

• You can receive a certificate of completion if you completed at least 90% of this webinar.
  – Email askncela@manhattanstrategy.com
Stay Connected With OELA

• Visit OELA Home Page:
  • [https://www2.ed.gov/about/offices/list/oela/index.html](https://www2.ed.gov/about/offices/list/oela/index.html)

• Subscribe to Nexus Newsletter:
  • [https://ncela.ed.gov/ncela-nexus](https://ncela.ed.gov/ncela-nexus)

• NCELA on Twitter:
  • [https://twitter.com/ASKNCELA1](https://twitter.com/ASKNCELA1)

• OELA Facebook Page:
  • [https://www.facebook.com/ED.OELA/?ref=bookmarks](https://www.facebook.com/ED.OELA/?ref=bookmarks)

• OELA on LinkedIn:
  • [https://linkedin.com/company/ed-oela](https://linkedin.com/company/ed-oela)

• OELA on Pinterest:
  • [https://in.pinterest.com/ed_oela/](https://in.pinterest.com/ed_oela/)

• OELA on SoundCloud:
  • [https://soundcloud.com/ed_oela](https://soundcloud.com/ed_oela)
OELA Contact Information

Melissa Escalante
Management and Program Analyst, OELA
Melissa.Escalante@ed.gov
202-401-1407
Thank You!