

Kiva Process: New York City – May 9, 2011

Round 1:

**What should we stop doing in EL Education?
What current classroom/school practices and policies are disadvantaging EL students
and getting in the way of their academic progress?
What ought to be eliminated?**

CARD 1

- The isolation of TESOL's from content/other teachers.
- The community from viewing dual language/bilingual skill acquisition as subtractive or detailing the position of multiple languages
- Viewing the populations served/by EL educators as moral ethic;
- Marginalizing/preventing EL educators from advocates from their students needs

CARD 2

- National attitudes about ELL bilingualism and multiculturalism must be shifted.
- Stop the arrogance!

CARD 3

- Stop predominant attitude that bilingualism is not a good thing.
- Stop disdaining work of ESL teachers.
- Stop hiring / promoting teachers who are not trained & certified to teach all learners.
- Stop preventing ESL teachers from practicing best practices
- Stop so many summative assessments
- Stop hindering use of more practical, helpful formative assessments

CARD 4

- We need to stop isolating teachers who have expertise with emergent bilinguals
- We need to stop ignorance about the beneficial nature of bilingualism and multilingualism
- We need to stop social stratification based on funding which limits quality education to better funded districts reducing possibilities creating inequity in proven districts
- We need to stop reproducing under-prepared linguistically and culturally competent teachers

CARD 5

- Use of inappropriate assessments/punitive testing
- Requiring EL students to submit to high stakes exams designed for English proficient peers
- Graduating requirements
- Looking at ELS from deficit perspective
- Linking ed. Programs for ELS w/ special ed.
- Lack of teacher training
- Lack of training of administrators
- Not providing time for language acquisition process to take place
- Reliance on ELL specialists
- Over placement of ELS in sped- disproportionate
- Federal policy
- Improper identification placement

CARD 6

- We should stop grouping ELL as a homogenous group. There is a wide range of diversity and therefore we need to treat it that way. Let's find a plan that allows for this.
- We should stop spending so much time on tests and more time on oral language development.

CARD 7

- The inadequate testing system
- English only
- The punitive accountability program

- Inadequate teacher ELLs preparation

CARD 8

- Stop using the term ELL's/LEP and use the term bilingual emergent.

CARD 9

- Stop graduating teacher or certifying teacher that do not have ESL/bilingual courses
- Stop saying Dual Language is not a bilingual program.
- Stop high stakes assessments on Emergent bilinguals
- Stop creating standards/core curriculum that are not aligned to Emergent bilingual students
- Stop taking funds from Emergent bilinguals
- Stop expecting teachers to have skills without telling them what the current population needs, make that a part of their "higher education". Tell them they need EL training and make it obtainable. Allow current teacher obtainable EL support and professional development.

CARD 10

- Stop certifying teachers without EL coursework
- Stop so much teacher talk- students need to be the speaker and the teacher facilitate
- Stop "pull-out" ESL- the lessons never seem to strengthen student learning- a lot of fluff.
- Stop waiting for students to fail before referring them to SPED.

CARD 11

- We should stop ignoring the research that says that the best way to learn English for ELL is through the native language. We should stop ignoring the meta analysis studies that support this finding. We should stop hiding the fact that anywhere that there are good bilingual ed. programs, these students outperform mainstream students. Stop being afraid of the "political climate"- it will always be against these very issues.

CARD 12

- Stop graduating pre-service teachers who are not trained to teach ELL's
- Stop High Stakes Testing that jeopardize ELL students at so many fronts.

CARD 13

- Stop considering only one type of English proficiency. Aim at academic proficiency.
- Stop providing professional development for teachers who do not need/ie how to take the tests.
- Stop not allowing teachers to make decisions about what their students need.
- Stop focusing in English and disregarding the native language- we are not in the XXI century and the majority of the people outside the US are bilingual

CARD 14

- Stop defining English language proficiency in such a way that a "proficient" student still cannot excel in an English-only classroom w/out support. "Proficient" must be proficient in academic English.
- Stop treating ELS as an "other" group, separate from the general population
- Stop certifying teachers who cannot effectively serve ELS. All teachers must understand how to serve ELS.

CARD 15

- ELLs need more than 1 year exemption on state tests
- Should be tied to English proficiency rather than time in the US schools
- Require states to prepare teachers and district decision matters with the knowledge and skills to provide appropriate instruction for ELLs and choose/design curriculums to support English language dev. And dual language programs
- Growth model of testing should replace "one size fits all" model

CARD 16

- Stop AYP be weight as much for AMAO.
- Stop having 1 year exemplification state test.
- Stop not funding schools after students reached a proficiency level that is considered "the appropriate one" to be out of the ELL program. However, the student is still monitored for 2 years.
- Stop so much testing
- Stop linking illegals with ELL

CARD 17

- Stop creating assessments that were not designed for ELLs
- Stop imposing models of instruction and curriculum that are not appropriate for ELLs
- Stop pulling out ESL teachers from their instructional time to administer and score tests- students miss weeks of services!
- Stop demanding the same academic requirements for SIFE students. Stop ignoring their needs.
- Stop ignoring needs of new students/beginners. It is not addressed in the new CORE standards.
- Stop emphasizing reading and writing at the sacrifice of verbal ability and development.

CARD 18

- Viewing an L2 as a liability
- Promoting English-only bilingual programs (ie: ESL immersion)
- Quotas for subgroups on a schools AYP
- Politicizing bilingualism
- Expecting ELLs to miraculously be on the same language proficiency as their monolingual peers in less than 5 years.
- Graduating pre-service teachers with no experience working with ELLs

CARD 19

- Marginalizing students who are low performing separate is not equal
- Evaluating teachers based on students who struggle with English and have disabilities
- Preparing and graduating teachers who aren't prepared to teach

CARD 20

- Placing ELL's in content classes at secondary level where the language of instruction, English, is in and of itself cognitively challenging. To ask students to learn new concepts through a language they do not know, is asking them to do two cognitively demanding tasks simultaneously- nobody can do this. Hence, this type of ELL student placement sets the students up for failure. Then, we punish these students by attending summer school, repeating the class (which is taught the same way, through the same language) and re-take the same class, often to fail again. Then, they age-out at 21, or drop out earlier.

CARD 21

- Stop test ELs with different norms
- Stop English only policy in some schools
- Stop treating Bilingual Programs as less
- Stop improper placement
- Stop the low expectations of ELs

CARD 22

- Current accountability system
- Do not punish school districts for not making AMAO's (or AYP) target.
- Ensure teachers are aware of which ELP standards they are using.
- Over identify ELL Special Ed
- Stop mandate that all ELL must be tested in all the modalities (deaf students should be exempt from ELP testing mute from speaking test)

CARD 23

- Isolating ESL from mainstream classes
- Using ESL teachers from instructional time to fill in gaps in school day or other programs, absenteeism, etc.
- Tracking Ss and isolating groups (B, I, Adv)
- Labeling schools as failing b/c they have a high concentration of ELLs
- Administering high stakes testing to emergent language lessons
- Using NYSESLAT exam to determine proficiency when it is more rigorous then state exams

CARD 24

- ESL instruction must be aligned with mainstream to ensure ELL's access to all rounded rich curriculum
- Teachers of ELL should not be treated as support personnel but viewed as specialists for a diverse population of English language teachers.

- Teacher preparation programs must focus on ESL methodologies for the all content specialists.
- We need to stop assessing students before they reach the threshold of proficiency. We should allow ELLs at least 2 years before they can be engaged into a high stake testing.

CARD 25

- Isolating students in level-based ESL programs and promote effective integration programs that encourage student participation and learning in content-based English learning environments.
- Stop promoting dual-certification for teachers in ESOL/Content Core and instead change Administrative organization to promote teacher collaboration.

CARD 26

- Stop using testing for punitive measures for students, teachers, administrators, and districts
- Stop using English in place of bilingual ie, ELLs, OELLA, etc.
- Stop the testing that leads to teaching to the test, teaching what is on the test
- Stop using pull-out Ed programs
- Stop EBs from being viewed as a drawback for school
- Stop the education of EBs w/o the daily and consistent presence of teachers who know how to work with them

CARD 27

- Stop pushing one-size-fits-all value added testing, especially at the school level for ELLs

CARD 28

- Stop using multiple choice as the primary testing mechanism. Many ELs come from countries and cultures in which MC is never used. They see it as confusing. They cannot demonstrate their learning that way.
- Stop lumping ELs together- Taking any 2 ELs at the same proficiency level- 3 mos later. They are at different levels because of all the other factors besides Eng. Level.
 - L1 proficiency
 - LI academics
 - Socio-cultural
 - Etc, etc.

CARD 29

- We need to stop using summative assessments as a means to gauge language proficiency and acquisition.
- We need to stop graduating teachers who do not have TESOL/ELL Liscense
- We need to stop graduating teachers who do not have a formal back round with teaching diverse learners
- We need to stop putting kinds in buckets and labels

CARD 30

- Allowing pre-service teachers to graduate with minimal to no credits in the teaching of English learners.
- Varying curriculum for students based on language designation.
- Over relying on high stakes test results regardless of language proficiency

CARD 31

- Viewing ELL as a demographic that only needs language, and not content
- Graduating Pre-service teachers w. no exposure to the best practices for ELLs.

CARD 32

- Blaming ESL programs and bilingual programs as being the main factor for students not achieving (when in reality districts are not keeping “the fidelity” to the programs (not being implemented well or using ESL teachers as the “tutors” for ELLs)
- Stop using ESL/bilingual terminology freely when not having a strong understanding of ESL/bilingual education (such as LT ELLS, SIFE, dually identity etc)
- Stop teaching to the test- instead of teaching content through ESL methodology

CARD 33

- Top creating assessments not normed for ELLS
- Stop graduating & certifying teachers w/ no experience w/ ELLS

CARD 34

- [This was a personal appeal requesting OCR assistance – the information will be forward to appropriate Department of Education personnel]

CARD 35

- Using non-norm referenced assessments for ELLS to compare to mono-linguals
- Using ELA or other state assessments determine AYP and AMAO's for accountability with newly or recently arrived ELLS – up to 3 yrs or longer for SIFE students
- In addition:
 - Too much instructional time loss
 - Punitive to individual schools & district
 - Can not rush language development these assessments are not testing content knowledge-only language

CARD 36

- Stop assuming that all ELs are the same, they speak a variety of languages, have a variety of educational backgrounds and come from a variety of cultures
- Stop putting them through high stakes testing when they arrive in the country without any prior education (refugees)
- Stop comparing them to other English speaking peers in high stakes testing
- Stop not training preservice teachers and administrators in ESL
- Stop leaving it to the districts to make all the decisions on ELLS
- Administrators need to be required to support their ELLs and be held accountable

CARD 37

- I think that we should stop treating EL students as a homogeneous group. Not all EL students are Hispanic and not all learn at the same pace.
- High stakes testing, politics, inappropriate assessment are also things that should stop in EL Education
- We should stop ignoring research and data. Stop ignoring the input of those in the field.

CARD 38

- Utilizing stigmatizing and limiting labels for Bilingual Learners (LEP/ELL)
- Ignoring the research on Bilingual Educations
- Mandating Assessments that do not yield correct information for instruction
- Making accountability punitive
- Placing Bilingual Learners in a vacuum

CARD 39

- Stop being reactive & proactive- Everyone knew we were getting an influx of immigrants & no one prepared at the school level- once we received the students we began to prepare pd, support, collaboration w/ agencies- This should have been done prior to receiving the students so that the transition was smooth for everyone.
- Stop using the same assessment instruments for everyone- "Multiple languages + ELA grams should be looked at, at the same time, use that for overall accountability.
- Stop funding on ESL pgms at the IHES, we need funding for full bilingual programs of all languages- top 5 at least!
- Stop teaching new foreign lang- use the students native lang as first lang- 2nd Eng & have them learn a 3rd lang as a foreign lang.

CARD 40

- Treating ELs as a homogenous group theres diversity is NL level of educating disability status, etc!
- Treating English as the only thing that matters.
 - Find ways to assess NL proficiency , literacy, content (CALP) require accountability for NL instruction
- Allowing teacher certification with no preparation to work with ELs
- Treating bilingualism as a deficit
- Testing students in English after 1 day, 1 year

CARD 41

- Stop assuming that ELs are the sole responsibility of the ELL professionals.
- Stop assuming that ELs are a homogenous group.
- Stop assuming that PD is at the higher ed/ teacher preparation level. it's on going at the school district/ building and should be for all staff providers.
- Stop reducing the number of credits for class endorsements in ELL, TESOL Bilingual. Need to have course in culture. Famous people, festivals & food will not help!
- Stop high stakes testing and requiring ELs with only 10 mos in a English speaking environment to take a test in math & science even with modifications. Must fund alternative methods.

CARD 42

- Lowering credit requirements for ELL cross-endorsement for tchrs certified in something else
- Equating ESOL with bilingual; they are similar, yet inherently different
- Requiring ELs to take state ACADEMIC assessments after only 10 months (or less); give at least 2-3 years for that, since research shows it takes a minimum of 10 years to achieve comparable academic proficiency
- Equating READING teaching/ ability with ESOL teaching/ ability (to teach)

CARD 43

- Waiting for a student to fail in order to be referred to special ed.
- Isolating the EL population and referring to them as “You Kids” or “those “kids”
- “English only” policy
- Stop being inconsistent

CARD 44

- Graduation in 4 yr.
- Testing that compares students to English speaking peers regardless of time in US

CARD 45

- Holding ELL specialist accountable for ELLs: all faculty should own all students
- Certifying (especially cross-certification) should include classroom observation & review in specialty
- **Bilingual= truly proficient in both languages.
- Set up clear criteria for ELL placement so as to least support and student needs.
- Decrease nature language causes as a world language component
- Do not dilute good regs for ELLs figure put curriculum & alternative assessment that evaluates students to reach their post hs good goals

CARD 46

- Stop lumping ELLs together in high stakes testing. Adolescent SIFEs are not the same as hearing disabled kids.
- Stop “norming” tests against inappropriate groups.
- Stop penalizing ESL teachers for working with high risk kids.
- Stop retaining EL's based on land acquisition.

CARD 47

- We should stop using broad and undefined levels and measures such as beginner, intermediate, advanced, and proficient. I am speaking in regards to the NYS English as a 2nd language achievement test. Instead, we should teach and assess based on the 5 stages of second language [can't read word] (Kristen + Terell).
- We should stop the conversation in ESL Bilingual education and make all schools dual language schools. Bilingualism and multilingualism are the foundations of a globally successful economy.

CARD 48

- Allowing teachers and administrators to become credentialed (or even graduate) without quality preparation to teach/ or lead teachers working in schools where there are EL's.
- Ignoring the primacy of oral language; make sure teachers understand lang acquisition and 2nd lang acquisition
- Ignoring the need for quality (that is research based and proven professional for all teachers and admin.
- Ignoring the importance of introducing content for ELS; teachers need support in how to do this

CARD 49

- Please stop the policy of testing English language learners after one year in English language arts. All research indicates this is not enough time to develop academic language.
- Ensure new teachers have at least 6 credits in the education of English language learners.
- Provide opportunities for “SIFE’s” or advanced students who are also ELS. Stop grouping all ELS in one group for ex. my school has an 8th grade class with 32 ELS beg/int/adv students as well as long term ELS and new comers. Not the best placement.

CARD 50

- Too much testing in general for ELLs and non ELLs which take the time away from instruction – (formative assessments)
- Instruction in secondary school for ELL is teacher [led] it doesn’t take into account the need for ELL to develop oral/listening skills-

CARD 51

- Stop administering NYSESLAT (the state assessment) to students with severe intellectual disabilities.
- Stop hiring incompetent teachers

CARD 52

- High stakes testing ELLs are not prepared in 10 months to take these assessments. The assessment tool should measure language proficiency. Allow ELLs to develop the cognitive language

CARD 53

- Stop English-only policy
- Testing special education ELLs w/out clear exceptions and guidelines
- Penalized schools cant graduate ELLs in the time frame.
- Ignore Native language curriculum and proficiency should be scheduled in accountability
- Relying only on standardized test results.
- Evaluating teachers based on students performance data/ Merry Pay

CARD 54

- EL students are treated as inferior to the others which obviously affects their self-esteem. currently, these students hate to identify themselves as EL students.
- We should stop placing the new comer EL students without proper evaluation. Students performances depends so on the proper and correct evaluation of each and every individual student. This practice is getting in the way of their academic progress.
- We should stop placing EL students in the content area classes right from day one of their attendance in the school. They simply don’t understand their English speaking teaches and end up getting only frustrated and intimidated.

CARD 55

- Students rise to the level of expectations we set. We should stop setting low expectations for ELL students.
- Teachers are around these students every day we should not ignore their input but value it. (one of the best assessment tools)

CARD 56

- Stop treating all the English learners as a group. The students are individuals with a unique set of needs. A 19 year old 9th grader from El Salvador who can’t read in English or Spanish cannot sit in global history class taught in English. [signed name, with email address]

CARD 57

- I feel we need to stop lumping reading/literacy instruction w/ second language instruction. Districts are not held accountable enough for who is servicing the English Learners. “Interim” uncertified teachers are becoming the cost effective way out for too many Districts in Eastern Long Island.

CARD 58

- Give ELLs with varied abilities differentiated ways to learn succeed and graduate- EX. SIFES don’t keep all instruction same for all
- Train administrators to supervise bil./ESL programs through instructional leadership

- Don't leave ELLs out of the CCC
- Don't set up ELLs to fail by testing too soon in content areas
- Don't keep ELLs from registering in public schools

CARD 59

- Testing in 10 months for ELA testing and immediately for content areas
- School based decision making for ELLs. Principals do NOT understand ELL program needs.
- Equating guided reading with ELL instruction.
- Equating “co-teaching” with an ELL teacher being a teaching assistant. We are certifies teachers and need to be partners in preparation, teaching AND assessment.
- Stop considering teaching fellows as certified teachers BEFORE they become certified like Teach for America and similar programs.

CARD 60

- We need to stop scape goating teachers who then blame students for their struggles and start blaming irrational policies

CARD 61

- Credit based system
- High stake testing
- Graduating pre-service teachers without EL experience assigning students to grade level (esp. H.S)

CARD 62

- Framing the policy issues to simplistically-
- ELs are not a homogenous group.
- Language acquisition relies on oral language development in order to grow reading comprehension and writing fluency – stop giving oral language short shrift in instruction
- Not knowing English (yet) is not an intellectual / social deficit – build on the strengths these students bring
- Accrediting teacher prep programs that don't prepare teachers who understand language acquisition.
- Over-relying on a few standardized tests to tell you what you think you need to know about college/career readiness of ELs.

CARD 63

- Administrators need to know ELLs.
- ELLs are not the responsibility of the whole school community
- All teachers need ELL training
- Additional funding

CARD 64

- Stop creating the impression that all ELLs are the same a mono ethnic group, students new to ELLs are very different than long term ELLs are. Teachers need to understand their BIG differences.
- Stop standing over us every new administration instead of building on success as a part EG innovative approaches recent project that gave us funds of knowledge –still popular but also [cant read the words] an excellent program for ELLs middle school in science now gone and much needed also involved collaboration with real scientists and committed teachers.
- Thinking most kids only learn in school we need to harness resources of other learning settings and connect them to schools more strategically

CARD 65

- STOP assuming that these in leadership positions know about English learners
 - superintendents – assist. Superintendents
 - principals – political leaders etc. need to know their community in order to advocate for the ELs in their communities.

CARD 66

- STOP using deficit terms
- Office of Special Ed and ELL's
- Terms-vulnerable, high needs, at risk

- Over-representation in Special Ed

CARD 67

- Well Differentiated PD for teachers – and administrators –
 - *Grammar + Str. of Eng. In all content teachers as part of development to work with ELLs.
 - *Cult/Linguistic diversity courses for administrators.
- STOP student deficit model and look at teacher deficits in the ability to deliver instruction to emerging bilinguals.

CARD 68

- We have to stop accepting the premise that bilingual education is dead.
- Stop thinking of ELLs as hardly a deficit and linking them to special ed
- Allowing schools to miss-identify and misplace students.
- Stop thinking of ESL as the very route to achievement.
- Unprepared general education English teachers plead not to be in charge of EL's instructive programs.
- Stop misinforming parents about ELLs rights and the parents to option to place them according to their level of proficiency.

CARD 69

- Do not allow non-professional people to identify and place EL students into their places
- Stop the dept. of education NYC from lying about the graduation rates of EL's
- Stop identify the office of ELs with special ed.

CARD 70

- Disparity between tests, E.G. NYSESCAT-ELA-REGENTS. There are cases when ELLs would pass –ELA-REGENTS and not the NYSESCAT. What happened to the multiple criteria.

CARD 71

- Stop pushing the idea that ESL is the only answer to educating ELLs
- Stop misinforming parents about their rights in bilingual education
- Stop manipulating the data and show the true picture
- Stop trying to make the student of a language other than English feel "less than" because they don't understand English and provide them with appropriate instruction

CARD 72

- We should stop schools who make excuses for not providing bilingual programs within their schools community, leaving a selected few schools to provide services.
- We should stop making assumptions about what ELLs need and use scientifically based research and practices to support instruction.
- We should stop principals from eliminating bilingual programs.

CARD 73

- Stop lying/manipulating data at the federal, state, and local levels
- Stop misinforming and coercing parents to opt out of bilingual education
- Stop placing ELs in classrooms with teachers who don't have a background in EL instruction without giving them support, and require that they take courses in language and English development.

CARD 74

- We should stop assuming what students know and don't know!
- Stop treating ELLs like they come with no content knowledge
- Stop preparing ELLs for the same goals. Some ELLs may have plans that do not involve a secondary education (trade school, vocational school, jobs); perhaps these plans.

CARD 75

- I agree that it would be lovely to focus on helping our emergent bilinguals develop oral language before focusing on reading and writing. However, as a high school teacher in an affluent school district with mostly Asian students who may enter in grades 10, 11, or even 12, I don't have the luxury of time. These students are intent on entering college in a timely manner (or at least by the time they're 21), and I find that focusing primarily on writing (particularly essays) is what works best. Of course, I have a specialized group of students, all fluent in their native language (and no SIFEs)

CARD 76

- Stop assuming all teachers know how to teach ELLs.
- Should not assume that all ELLs are the same.
- Should not compare/test ELLs and native speakers after 1 year in the country.

CARD 77

- Stop putting ELL kids in general education high school science with no support for science teacher, i.e. no communication between ESL teacher and science teacher, and no real professional development for science teachers in teaching ELL kids

CARD 78

- Stop overtesting the children and make the children's tests more equitable.

CARD 79

- We should stop punitive measures tied to testing and the small school initiatives. Due to the closing of large comprehensive high schools, parents and students have been left with less choice in ELL programming. The number of DL programs in the city has decreased while the number of ESL students has stayed the same which limited program choice.

CARD 80

- Stop inappropriate and excessive high stakes testing
- Stop unrealistic high school graduation requirement (4 years)
- Stop English-only policy.
- Stop setting low expectations.
- Stop relying only on standardized testing data.
- Stop hiring teachers who cannot communicate effectively in English and in native language for ELs

CARD 81

- Additional supports are needed for ELL students to prepare for the tests, and to re-adjust to the environment
- Tests should be customized to the student's background.

CARD 82

- Stop implementing common core state standards without accompanying ELD standards embedded...including teaching considerations for multiple languages [a parenthetical statement has been deleted]

CARD 83

- Stop teaching curriculum that is NOT designed for ELs and that is not conducive to leveraging native language abilities/learning.

CARD 84

- Stop pulling ELL students from their mainstream class.
- Stop ignoring multiple needs—not just language.
- Stop putting money on English-only→we need to address other needs, such as losing their parents' language.
- Yes, ELLs need the time to learn oral language, but we should not wait until they're ready→they should continue to learn at their grade level and make progress in academic achievement.
- How can we make sure that ELLs are being taught and they are learning as any other student would do?
 - All classes should have representation of native speakers of English
 - When students start school, should be taught the basics→don't assume they know it

CARD 85

- Stop considering the ELA Regents as part of ELL high school graduation requirements.
- Stop testing students in ELA after one year of enrollment in an ELSS.

CARD 86

- Instead of being exempt, students should be given an extension.
- ELL students are being put all together in one group; instead should be combined with monolingual students
- Eliminate the politics and think of students' needs
- Reading and writing doesn't teach hands on oral expression to help our ELL students.

- Change the curriculum—make it fun for the students to learn; apply music not just reading and writing.

CARD 87

- Assessment going mad
- One year (newcomers) testing might be unfair
- ELL students are not a homogeneous group, but rather diverse
- Interpreting the data
 - How we interpret the data is an issue
 - The importance we place on the data is disproportional with the overall significant factors

CARD 88

- Stop assessing new arrivals with one year of residency in the US with the English Language Arts assessment. ELLs should be given more time to acquire the English language before they are administered that test.

CARD 89

- We need to stop forcing ELLs to feel that they need to demonstrate English proficiency in 1 year and 1 day. (This impacts on effective instruction and pushes youngsters to drop out).
- Stop having accountability programs that are for English speakers only.

CARD 90

- We need to stop “killing languages” and begin embracing other languages than English in the schools, K-12. The world is multilingual; we need to begin to create spaces where students, K-12, can become multilingual.
- We not only have to stop certifying bilingual teachers who have no experience and/or prior experience in teaching ELLs, but we also must stop certifying administrators who have no knowledge of the instructional nuances involved in teaching ELs.

CARD 91

We should stop:

- Acting as if (i.e. providing services and developing IEPs as if) ELs are no longer ELs once they are identified as having disabilities. (These students often need more NL/bilingual instruction for a longer period of time than their EL peers without disabilities).
- Systems of accountability that only value skills demonstrated in English and the acquisition of English.
- Isolating bilingual/ESL services/programs/providers from “mainstream” and “special ed” programs.

CARD 92

- Stop teacher bashing—it doesn’t help us in the classrooms.
 - It breeds contempt and disciplinary issues. It also makes both ELL students and teachers feel underappreciated.

CARD 93

- Stop giving districts the impression that it is ok to ignore preschool ELs.

CARD 94

- Stop using regulations for K-12 assessments and identification and improperly imposing them on pre-K. Pre-K kids must be assessed by multiple measures—tests are weak, unreliable, and not available in all languages for this age.

CARD 95

- Stop lumping preschool in with K-12 and create developmentally appropriate guidance for pre-school early language and literacy learning fit for multiple languages—not just two at a time.

CARD 96

- Stop treating students and districts as if all programs and student needs are alike—linguistically, academically, and demographically.
- Stop relying on literacy success as the focus of 2nd language success.
- Stop using high stakes testing to punish districts/students when research proves it takes 4-7 years under optimal conditions to achieve academic parity with standard peers.

CARD 97

- Stop treating ELL populations as “one-size fits all.” They are not a homogeneous group.
- Stop rushing the process of language acquisition.

- Stop focusing on reading and writing as literacy for ELs—include oral language
- Stop requiring ELLs to take assessments assigned for general students.
- Stop poor quality PD.
- Stop under-requiring field service for cross endorsement
- Stop marginalizing ELs in PD and in classroom
- Stop subtractive bilingualism

CARD 98

- What we should do is to promise more PD for teachers of ELLs. In my experience, with a social studies license, I was “thrown” into an ELL class. While I had my degree, I didn’t have the techniques or strategies. I learned along with students.
- Testing: there is too much emphasis on testing and expecting someone who’s been in the country to take the ELA is “cruel.”

CARD 99

- Stop wasting precious educational time, teachers’ wages, and hurting sensitive learners’ self-esteem by testing way above English proficiency levels and content area knowledge levels even in native language.

CARD 100

- Schools should eliminate practices that treat students like secondary citizens
- Schools need to eliminate curricula that do not take into account learning styles.
- They should eliminate professional development activities that do not prepare all teachers to work with ELs
- ELs are a major cohort within schools—schools should consider them “the main-stream”→organize instructional activities around their needs.

CARD 101

- I think we should stop treating students as if they have a disability; we should prepare teachers to deal with the student with different languages.

CARD 102

- Stop testing ELLs using standardized tests (in ELA, math, content areas) when they have been in the country for a very short time (often a year or less); if we know that it takes at least 5-7 years to develop academic language, why are we subjecting students who have just arrived to these tests?
- Stop segregating ELLs (both academically and socially); even students who are receiving pullout ESL (or in self-contained ESL classrooms) should have the opportunity to interact with peers and be fully involved in the school community.

CARD 103

- Stop the perception that multilingualism is a negative (it’s a resource and national treasure)
- Stop creating negative feelings toward kids by asking local districts to carry the burden of funding (help us out!)
- Stop restricting creative approaches...if they are proven to be effective
- Stop using undefined terms (define them first!)
- Stop “push-back” against kids by recognizing that learning a language to the point of ACADEMIC PROFICIENCY in multiple content areas TAKES TIME (1 year is insufficient)

CARD 104

- Stop writing policy and grants that ignore small SEA/LEAs—esp. those who cannot support dual programs due to small numbers of ELs (less than 50?)
- Stop using undefined or poorly defined terminology (SIFE, etc.)
- Stop penalizing LEAs/SEAs for enrolling ELs—esp. secondary students who are 17-21 years old and may not be able to earn enough credits to graduate “on time”
- Stop comparing EL subgroup test scores to other subgroups—and stop being surprised when ELs don’t perform as well as native English speaking students on unfair measures.
- Stop siloing EL programs so that only EL staff have interactions with ELs students and families
- Stop ignoring hot issues like identification of Native American ELs, SpED ELs, SIFE ELs

CARD 105

- Maintain accountability for ELL performance but provide fair tests, especially for the students who are older and who are learning English
- Be sure that IHEs prepare per-service teachers for working with students from a variety of language and culture backgrounds
- Provide cultural sensitivity and ESL methodology to all teachers (in-service)

CARD 106

- Stop choosing 4 years as the graduation rate for AYP. Some students need more than 4 years to have adequate English language and academic skills and knowledge to be successful post-secondary.
- Emphasis on testing for all students and for ELLs needs to move away from the over-emphasis on standardized tests.

CARD 107

- Separating ESL education from other content areas!
- Teachers need to stop seeing ESL students as if they are someone else's problem!

CARD 108

- Stop holding ELLs accountable to same benchmarks (AYP) as English speakers.
- Working policy in ELLs -> set benchmarks according to ELP level so that schools do not force/pressure ELL teachers (bilingual) teachers to prematurely transition students.
- Stop requiring secondary ELLs to graduate w/i 4 years. Provide reasonable appropriate assessments and support
- Stop allowing confusing messages about educating ELLs.
- Stop allowing preschool programs to be English only.

CARD 109

- Testing bilingual learners with severe disabilities—their IEPs indicate—no standardized testing! We must stop violating their federal rights.
- Lack of fidelity in program implementation. Many students—particularly those with disabilities—travel back and forth from ESL to Bilingual Ed to ESL—for years.
- Treating BE as a cultural program for singing and cooking. BE is about academic achievement; content area learning; higher order thinking skills; academic language.
- Treating BE/NL/ESL as a remedial program.

CARD 110

- Inappropriate implementation of DL/BIL/ESL programs due to pressures of current testing requirements
- Not including Native language assessments in a school's accountability plan
- Not holding school districts accountable for funds generated by English learners
- Testing bilingual learners with special needs with NYSESLAT

CARD 111

- Stop marginalizing the participants in the profession by adding sufficient classroom teachers.
- Stop the uninformed from administering and supervising programs for ELLs
- Stop the isolation among teachers of ELLs and content teachers

CARD 112

- Stop administering the NYSESLAT exam to students who are designated alternate assessment or their IEPs are exempt from standardized assessment
- Stop treating students/families who speak a language other than English as if they have a disability and there is something wrong with them.

CARD 113

- Ignoring the mandates
- Imposing models of instruction that were not designed to meet the needs of ELLs
- Thinking of ELLs as a monolithic group
- Viewing ELLs as having an inherent deficiency or having a disability—they're NOT diseased!
- Judging parents intellectual ability based on their language proficiency or education
- Assuming that parents of ELLs are not concerned or involved in their child's education because they do not attend formal school events.

- Creating assessment systems that are not normed or designed for ELLs
- Imposing unrealistic policies that reflect goals for language proficiency that are not aligned with research on language acquisition
- Utilizing instructional time for the administration and scoring of high stakes testing.
- Imposing graduation requirements that are not realistic in the given time frame.

CARD 114

- Stop separating language and content instruction
- Stop segregating students in an attempt to create homogenous groups by linguistic proficiency, prior academic knowledge/skills
- Stop setting/penalizing schools for unrealistic graduation rates for ELLs
- Stop testing ELLs to see what they don't know
- Stop requiring dual certification rather than deep collaboration among teachers
- Stop low expectations exacerbated by unrealistic and unachievable so called "HIGH EXPECTATIONS"

CARD 115

- Stop over-reliance on high-stakes testing of English learners, particularly in English, as this practice is invalid and devastating to EL and the schools that serve them.
- Stop allowing principals with no preparation in this area from determining programming for EL at their school
- Stop destroying bilingual education through testing and accountability and ideologies that are anti-immigrant at their core
- Stop punishing schools serving larger than average numbers of ELs through unfair accountability systems
- Stop punishing students simply for not knowing English
- Stop setting low expectations for the ELs but at the same time set high ones with the support and achieve them.

CARD 116

- Low teacher expectations
- Narrow curriculum
- Misuses of testing
- Testing originally was intended to monitor student achievement and gaps of less privileged groups. But the accountability policies are very punitive to schools that "need improvement" and teachers feel pressure to start teaching to the test and narrow curriculum.

CARD 117

- Stop the current testing practices
- Stop using assessments for ELLs that are non-norm-referenced and compare them to mainstream students
- ELA assessments for ELLs as well as other state tests for newly arrived ELLs are not an appropriate measure.
- ELLs should not take state tests for at least 3 years and longer for SIFE students
- The high school results for ELLs should not be compared to monolingual students. ELLs need a longer time to complete HS graduation requirements. An alternate pathway is needed for SIFEs
- Currently ELLs are being assessed in a rushed and incomprehensible manner—we are collecting data when we know the test group cannot perform the task

CARD 118

- Stop providing Federal Funds under the 1965 Bilingual Education act mandates/guidelines and it allows school district and local school administrators to use such allocation for the benefit of the organization as a whole and not the needs of the ELL population.

CARD 119

- Re-inventing wheel (acknowledge research literature)
- Talking about emergent bilinguals as ELLs/LEPs and especially, vulnerable/ special needs population
- Assuming English proficiency happens within 3 year instruction.
- Separating day care/ the school and K-12 education (policy/instruction/ teacher preparations)

- Accepting that bil. Ed is dead
- Assuming ESL is the answer to all students needs
- Over diagnose/ referral to special education services
- Opening new schools without any programs and educators that educate ELLs and principals without training
- School systems (all govt. levels) stop lying and hiding misinterpreting data
- Accepting that bilingual education is so dead
- Putting ELLs in English only classes with untrained teachers
- Misinforming parents about potential options and benefits of models.

CARD 120

- Stop starting over w/ data every school year
- Start collecting data using systems that speak to each other and can transfer student data across states so schools don't have to spend so much time relearning about students.

CARD 121

- Stop IHEs from providing classes taught by EdDs and PhDs with no public school teaching experience and add direct supervision of teachers of ELLs

Round 2:**What should we keep doing in EL Education?**

**What current classroom/school practices and policies are having a positive impact on EL students' learning and achievement?
What ought to be maintained?**

CARD 1

- Connecting language development (L1/L2/L3) and cultural learning/multicultural
- Learning and teaching about our histories of bilingual instruction/policy (colonies/Aspira/LAM)
- Connecting classroom practice to research on language development cultural compliance
- Holding government officials, agencies accountable for educational inputs (funding, certified teachers, class size reduction) and academic outcomes.
- Keep and bring back true dual language programs (maintain best practices beyond change in personnel and administration)
- Keep door open to access to data for independent research on ELL policy, program services, and results
- Keep creating new bilingual or dual language schools, including new high schools (eg. PAIHS- Pan American International High School) (ie. Adapting Inter.HS. model for Spanish-dominant immigrant students)

CARD 2

- Adding/developing parent programs
- Collaborating with classroom teachers and expand it
- Culture as a requirement for ESOL?TESOL certification
- Instructional programs that work: GLAD, SIOP, CALLA, dual immersion
- Ensuring proper student placement

CARD 3

- We need to keep providing our ELL's with optimal learning environments and continue teaching ELLs so that they can perform to high levels of intellectual performance
 - Rigorous curriculum
 - High level of support
 - School culture
 - Cutting edge professional

CARD 4

- Keep holding schools accountable for the performance of our students.
- Adapting response to Intervention (RTI) for ELLs

- Training mainstream teachers about the needs of ELLs
- Requiring fully certified ESL/bilingual teachers for our students
- Teaching students their native language whenever possible.
- Keep having these conversations with stakeholders so that the words we share here INFLUENCE policies

CARD 5

- Keep the Title 3 and refugee grant funding consistent when funding is lost, programs are inconsistent
- Keep promoting communication with family
- Keep collaborating with higher education to promote action based research within classrooms and provide professional development to classroom and mainstream teachers
- Keep having these conversations with the government getting stakeholder feedback

CARD 6

- Continue to have high quality ELL teachers
- Continue these conversations
- Continue to hire teachers who are bilingual
- Continue training content and classroom teachers to teach ELLs
- Continue to work with parents
- Continue to tie classroom practice to research

CARD 7

- Keep having TESOL as a profession even if we ask all teachers to be prepared to work with ELs
- Keep having these cross-state class level (K-12, Higher Ed) dialogs like today and getting this together

CARD 8

- Native Language Arts (in whichever mediums possible)
- Small group instruction for ELL Proficiency levels
- Alternate teacher certifications (Teach for America) while increasing the programs understanding about ELL instruction
- **ADVOCATING!**

CARD 9

- Continue start up Bilingual Programs- Dual Language
- Continue more professional development for teachers to have the competencies for teaching ELs effectively (Pre-service and Inservice)
- Issues with funding mentioned- so we need continued funding for promoting and implementing best practices and professional development
- Continue developing better assessment instruments to capture needs of ELs and SPED to be distinct

CARD 10

- Continue to research and develop programs for dually identify ELLs that REALLY WORK
- Continue to clarify regulations- so that everyone can interpret and follow (for students with long-term ELLs, SIFE, and Special Education)

CARD 11

- Keep teaching in Special Ed- It's no longer just babysitting

CARD 12

- Encourage teachers of ELs have dual certifications
- Developing successful dual language models
- Share best practices
- Provide more internships and pre-service training for future teachers of ELs
- Provide professional development for in-service teachers
- Develop more leaderships w/in EL.

CARD 13

- Involving parents and community
- Encouraging for dual certifications
- All teachers would help ELs w/ language development

- Hire qualified and dedicated bilingual teachers and staff
- Explicit teaching of vocabulary
- Applying balanced literacy approach in ESL instruction

CARD 14

- Continue developing best practices for developing IEPs for ELLs
- Continue to provide PD for content area teachers- how to educate ELLs, develop their vocabulary, etc.

CARD 15

- We should continue small group learning activities (with diversified native languages, if possible.)
- We should continue to maintain interaction between mainstream and ESL teachers. (This is the designation used in my school district- politically correct or not!)

CARD 16

- Differentiate instruction, assessment curriculum
- Continue content conversation
- Collaborate time
- Curriculum mapping- for transparency and alignment. Also to avoid redundancy.
- Native language support
- Funding sources for all types of ELLs that is sustainable EG- Longterm

CARD 17

- We should continue allowing the need to keep the mother language
- We should continue smaller group classes for ESL
- We should encourage dual language schools from K-12
- Continue cultural and community studies for ELLs

CARD 18

- Keep sharing best practices in ELL ed
- Have doctoral students engage in research relevant to ELLs, instructional programs.
- Continue pursuing for developments of native language arts standards
- Highlighting the development of academic language in both L1 and L2 and offering Prof. development to all teachers- bilingual, ESL, general Ed, Sp. Ed., ELLs in their classrooms
- Providing all classrooms with libraries that will support rigorous language and content in both languages included in Mia instructional models.
- Bilingual Programs should be maintained. Dual language programs should be maintained.

CARD 19

- Keep language instruction alive. This includes increasing foreign language programs
- Keep licensing for bilingual and ESL teachers and administrators. Course work should include how language is learned.
- Keep conversations in ELLs alive at all levels. City, State, Federal,- if you want to know the real issues

CARD 20

- Actually what we need to bring back:
 - FLES Program
 - Dual Language Program- although there are few true and far between- we need to bring them into the spotlight and duplicated
 - Keep effective practices even w/ changes in administrations
 - Bring back “Office of Monitoring”

CARD 21

(This group had a difficult time identifying anything positive to *KEEP*

- True D.C. models
- F.L. prop. In elementary but not replace Bil. Prog.
- Door open to data collection and research in NYC Public Schools
- Excellent bilingual teachers
- Office of Monitoring

CARD 22

- Content lang. be continued w. all students and teachers

- Continue teach their native language
- Size of class averaged
- Keep giving parent choice
- Continue hiring teachers that are qualified

CARD 23

- We should keep on preparing teachers to teach language and content
- Accountability with understanding of ELLs learning/acquisition

CARD 24

- Parents; involvement in determining what program their children should take to develop their English competencies- Transitional bilingual, dual language, ESL, etc.
- Dual certification for teachers- ESL + Special Ed, ESL + Math, ESL + Science, etc
- Teachers at the secondary level (middle and high schools) need to receive continued support in developing their students' academic language proficiency- many are not prepared for this challenge or do not see the developing academic language> part of their practice or a content areas teacher

CARD 25

- Preparing Bilingual Teachers
- Small size classrooms
- Working with families and inform them about the different ELL programs available to their children
- Teaching ESL through Content areas

CARD 26

- Having those kinds of conversations for the policy makers to listen to the experts from the field.
- Funding grant programs through which content area teachers can receive more pd about how to work with ELs

CARD 27

- Better teacher preparation
- Continue to build teacher leadership/Administration leadership
- Continue to have and share conversations to others to promote Bilingual Education
- More Professional Development on Second Language Learning

CARD 28

- Moving forward, with new education practices that don't teach to the test

CARD 29

- The vocational programs that exist and develop more
- Working with families and developing parent leaders
- Small classes
- Native language instruction and acknowledge its value
- Holding all levels of government accountable for funding monitoring

CARD 30

- Maintain bridge between EL teachers and content area teacher

CARD 31

- A continual dialogue about the importance of teaching academic language- continue and promote the idea that we are all academic language teachers

CARD 32

- Disseminating information about Best Practices for ELLs
- Exploring alternative assessment options for beginner level ELLs
- Challenging the status quo that ELLs and their language and learning needs are secondary to other learner needs.

CARD 33

- We need to keep developing individual education plans for ELs that target the particular needs for the student, this helps remove the emphasis on assuming a homogenous EL groups
- We need to offer incentives to dual-language and bilingual programs and promote secondary dual language programs

CARD 34

- Encouraging the formation of Dual Language Programs (as NY state has done by offering grants to districts to begin dual lang.); this type of program is not only proven to be effective for ELLs but sends important messages about the value of bilingualism

CARD 35

- ELs should continue to be included in High Stakes testing so that educators are mindful of EL programs and what their needs are

CARD 36

- Language and content integration
- Small teams of teachers responsible for small groups of students including their linguistic, academic
- Blur lines of distinction between ESL + bilingual + mainstream content teachers by focusing all teachers on language and content development of ALL students.

CARD 37

- Keep hiring bilingual teachers- keep the agenda of bilingualism and more
- Keep hiring teachers that are well prepared to teach ELLs

CARD 38

- Keep using small group instruction
- Keep reaching out to parents and bringing them in as partners in their children's learning
- Keeping dedicated funding for ELLs
- Keep providing educ. alternatives- vocational ed. is ok! Not all students have to be college bound. We need to value non-traditional students and programs
- Leadership prep. Programs need to continue (if they are doing so) to prepare admins. For ELLs and understand language acquisition.

CARD 39

- Keep designing ELL- instructional and other related services. Based on reliable validated scientific information
- Keep expanding or providing federal funds at the higher education level in the area of research that have an interest in the ELL population

CARD 40

- We need to keep in mind that no one solution is going to work for all districts or schools- we need to keep thinking creatively and looking for answers/solutions.
- We need to keep dreaming big- we have a lot of good things going, but we should keep looking for the best solutions

CARD 41

- Advocating for ELs and parents in terms of funding
- Testing accommodations for EL's and former EL's in NYS assessments
- Keeping resources at state and federal level integral on ELs

CARD 42

- Continue these conversations with legislation, use this process
- Keep training or encouraging higher ed institutions to dually certify teachers or at least all teachers receive classes on working with ELLs
- Keep monitoring districts that they are implementing appropriate services for ELLs
- Keep holding schools accountable for appropriately servicing ELLs
- Keep effective bilingual programs (dual language) L1 support.
- Keep accommodations for assessment for ELLs

CARD 43

- We have to keep funding needed to educate our children. Learning English takes time and money
- We have to keep preparing teachers well and giving them the power to make decisions
- We have to keep educating our society about bilingualism and ELLs.

CARD 44

- Provide funding for programs. Unfortunately tax payers often identify English learners as those who "suck the money" away from the "deserving" children of legal residents. I attended a board meeting where the board voted to use money to keep the athletic fields green (a parent had com-

plained about unsightly brown grass) At the same meeting, the board refused to hire a new ESOL teacher to provide what is minimally required. We must continue to fund programs for English Learners.

CARD 45

- Keep Title 3 funding
- Expand production of dual language books in various genres.
- Continue congruency of instruction for ELLs with mainstream classes
- Offer grants for individual teachers and schools to develop effective programs.
- Offering LAB-B for new admits and exit exam NYSESLAT at the end of the school year
- Using technology to accelerate student learning

CARD 46

- Keep making certain ESL teachers are dual certified to teach SC classes
- Provide funding Title III immigrant funds
- Increasing the dual language program
- Providing time for articulation between ESL and content area development and cultural competency
- Insisting on SIOP model of instruction
- Hiring bilingual teachers
- Holding all stake holders accountable at all levels of government

CARD 47

- Focus on kid's achievements
- Provide supplemental funding for schools with ELL's research and university level fair funding formulas
- Provide the means for districts to ensure a high quality education for all students
- Continue basing educational decisions on educational research such as SIOP model and language development for all (the "education as a business model" is not working)

CARD 48

- Continue to develop and train best practice such as SIOP
- Preparing ELL/ Divers Students/ Underscore populations to enter higher education endeavors
- Continue to work with parents of ELL student to trust the education system
- Continue to develop best practices in teaching Academic language not just conventional language

CARD 49

- We need to continue to work with parents and involve them in their child's education so that we can work as a coalition

CARD 50

- Keep reminding content teachers that they are also language teachers
- Keep encouraging conversations and collaboration between EL staff and content/mainstream staff, administrators and other specialist
- Keep promoting English language development standards to go along with the common core standards
- Keep offering incentives for teacher preparation programs that prepare present teachers to teach ELs such as the NPD grant
- Keep collaborating with other ED units on the Federal Level Title III, OSEP, Title I etc.

CARD 51

- We should keep providing the choice of bilingual education program
- Offering supplementary services, i.e. Title III let's keep and increase our Title III programs
- Hiring qualified staff to work with EL's
- Providing native language arts and native language support

CARD 52

- Keep working with families of ELs, use the language parents know
- Keep connecting language and culture
- Keep curriculum development for ELs
- Keep hiring bilingual teachers to teach ELs

CARD 53

- We should continue providing as much PD as possible and also we should have principals “Release” teachers who want to attend there PD sessions – very often teachers cannot avail themselves of PD because they cannot be (or won’t be) released for a non-attendance day

CARD 54

- Continue the collaboration between EL providers and classroom content staff
- Continue data collection and explanation to classroom content teachers and administrators
- Continue mentoring opportunities in the work place out in the community
- Continue the ownership of the guides of ELs by all stakeholders (classroom/ content/ administrators)
- Continue the good work on curriculum and assessment that helps to drive curriculum for ELs

CARD 55

- Keep a language objective in mainstream content areas and all classes
- Teach in the native language to offer skills from L1 to L2
- Keep hiring bi-lingual teachers
- Best practices to create IEP for ELL’s

CARD 56

- Continue conversations going between professionals
- Continue to educate administrators
- Continue reading support

CARD 57

- Applying research based/ best practices to increase what we know about this with further research
- Attempting to hire quality teachers. Emphasis is quality which may or may not be bilingual. Quality comes first.
- Paying attention to supporting teachers/students in low-incidence classrooms
- Raising the concerns/ needs of ELLs to their teachers in all national educational forms (eg. how are their needs met or not met through online learning to other techniques)

CARD 58

- Keep collaborating-admin/classroom/support (which takes years to develop)—understanding and examining data—LAS Links, state and fed assessment
- Showcasing and mentoring students to self-advocate
- Keep promoting the successes and sharing across districts and states
 - Writing for local paper
 - Presenting in community

CARD 59

- Continue to ensure that ELLs in special education get all the services as mandated on the IEP
- Continue to work with the whole child to bring in the culture and the family
- Continue to have high expectations
- Continue to provide Title III funds

CARD 60

- Keep the system of evaluation of EL students’ transcript for placement purposes, and make sure that a student gets his or her proper placement and credits.
- Keep continuing the small class sizes and tutorial help to EL students
- We keep teaching the EL students their first language, literature, and culture.

CARD 61

- Keep developing IEPs which include native language arts
- Keep funding teacher prep programs but add a bilingual secondary component
- Keep native language arts in the standards.

CARD 62

- As we continue to prepare ELs with rigorous and challenging curriculum and setting high expectation, we need to support financially the development of languages, native language and English and cultural learning for this global society. Our economy needs bilingual people to move the USA agenda. It is our win.

CARD 63

- We should continue working both with the parents and the students closely focusing on their cultural and historical backgrounds.

CARD 64

- Keep ELLs in classrooms with native speakers—do not place them in classrooms with majority ELL students. ELLs need access to the L2 and native English speakers need access to non-native English speakers.

CARD 65

- We should keep collaborating or teaming with other classroom teachers.
- We should keep smaller classroom sizes.
- Keep rigorous curriculum but tailor it to student needs
- Keep individual learning plans
- Keep funding for newcomer programs if additional support is necessary.

CARD 66

Keep doing:

- Using SIOP and CALLA across content areas with mainstream teachers.
- Use ESL standards (NYS) for ESL students
- Use native language in classrooms
- Hire teachers who are bilingual
- Collaborate with content area teachers
- Address the needs of SIFEs
- Evaluate student transcripts from home country for appropriate placement
- Train guidance counselors to appropriately place and schedule ELLs
- Maintain communication with parents in native language—reach out to parents so they feel comfortable

CARD 67

- Offer support to students in their native language.
- We should keep the focus on parental involvement.
- Offer funding for recruitment of ESL teachers.

CARD 68

We need to

- Keep immigrant funds to reach out to families to do parent outreach when the immigrant families are available—this is often on weekends and school vacations
- Keep PD for all content teachers to understand the role of the home language and how it supports students' learning in the second language
- Keep monitoring what school districts are doing, especially those with small numbers of ELLs
- Remind administrators that ELLs in high school have the right to a free appropriate public education (FAPE) until age 21

CARD 69

- Funding—keep providing extra funding for programming for ELs including bilingual educators, professional development
- Keep allowing model schools for ELs to do what they're doing→e.g. specialized high schools in NYC where all students are ELs, dual language schools, and CTT (collaborative team teaching)
- Unfortunately, this list is short as in recent years the feds have done very little good for ELs ☹

CARD 70

- Continue to allow specialized schools for EB students to develop and thrive
- Continue to create spaces for collaborative team teaching
- Continue funding to allow support for school, program, and professional development for all schools with EB students

CARD 71

Keep on doing

- Professional development on ELLs
- Providing a dedicated line of funding for ELLS (Title III)
- Providing testing accommodations for ELLs and former ELLs

- Requiring mandating services for ELLs
- Offering grants for enhancement/enrichment programs and services for ELLs
- Doing research on best practices for ELLs supporting the use of multiple models of instruction—bilingual, dual language, content sheltered ESL, SIOP, etc.

CARD 72

Continue:

- Holding conversations with those who are knowledgeable about EL Ed and inviting those who are less knowledgeable, including administrators, policy makers, and legislators.
- The curriculum work that was already funded by USED (e.g. funds of knowledge)
- Hiring teachers with dual certification in bilingual education and special education
- Reminding people why we began promoting BE in the 60s and 70s

CARD 73

- Certify ESL educators in Special Ed.
- Connect L1 with L2

CARD 74

- Continue Title II funding
- Keep accountability system (but that is appropriate for our ELLs)
- Keep collaboration with higher education institutions
- Keep doing extended learning opportunities
- Keep collaborating with Title I and IDEA

CARD 75

- Fostering conversation between teachers of ELLs and general teachers
- Keep teachers leadership programs informed about adding the needs of ELLs and emergent bilinguals
- Adhere to specific models of instruction in SIOP for mainstream teachers and CALLA teachers of ELLs
- Keep Vygotskian scaffolding
- Keep the conversation going both at forums such as these and back in our home districts

CARD 76

- Encourage Bilingual Education as innovative professional development for mainstream teachers/bilingual/ESL fostering bilingual education programs as enrichment funding quality program (Bilingual/DL/ESL)

CARD 77

Keep doing

- Extended learning opportunities—Saturday, after school, summer
- Assist districts in utilizing research-based best practices
- Native language instruction/heritage language
- ESL language development strategies in all classrooms
- Funding streams—maintain and supplement
- Collaboration—continue knocking down silos (p-16)

CARD 78

What should we keep doing:

- Hiring teachers who are bilingual or bilingually certified with Spanish/English, for long term ELLs who are Latinos and need to see/have teachers who may understand their expressions and understand that growing up in a bilingual, multi-dialectal community changes how we use both English and Spanish
- We need to continue some of the challenging instructional programs that came about through federal funding such as those for the Innovative Approaches project that gave us Funds of Knowledge, but also (Cheche Konnen)—an incredible collaboration with students, teachers, families
- Also, philology for children was a special program for ELLs/bilinguals that was one of the most intellectually challenging and rigorous areas our children have been exposed to.

CARD 79

Keep doing-

- Regular cross-disciplinary meeting like this to put our heads together—and regular structure opportunities to states to learn from each other like this

CARD 80

- Certification of bilingual teachers

CARD 81

Keep doing

- Providing funding for programs and PD for students and teachers
- Continue to fund comprehensive centers to assist state departments in leading in a focused and integrated way on behalf of ELLs throughout states
- Fund research studies which will help us better understand modification which we must t make in instruction to ensure success for ELLs
- To do better: look at low-incidence districts and how they can be better served—students and teachers.

CARD 82

Keep

- Small group instruction. ELLs, especially beginners, need opportunities to speak and learn in small groups tailored to their needs. It can't all be done in content classes.
- Keep providing a dedicated line of funding for ELLs.
- Keep testing accommodations for ELLs and former ELLs.
- Keep requiring mandated ESL services.
- Keep doing research on best practices for ELLs.
- Keep monitoring! Hold districts accountable.
- Keep vocational programs and add to them to provide options to students.
- Keep supporting different models of instruction: 1 size does not fit all.
- Keep the teacher voice in instructional decisions!

CARD 83

Keep doing

- Funding ESL
- Involving families—needs new emphasis
- Research to develop fair, valid assessments

Round 3:

What should we start doing in EL Education?

**What envisioned policies and practices would serve to ensure a quality education for ELs in the 21st century?
What ought to be initiated?**

CARD 1

- clearer assessments
- unified vision for ELL instruction
- opportunities to grow as a nation—research!

CARD 2

- bring back value and respect and funding for bilingual programs of quality (properly funded part of the equation)
- clearly articulate what the common core standards mean for ELLs
- Ensure leadership has the sensitivity and will and knowledge to oversee and cultivate effective programs and teachers for ELLs
- Monitor OCR regs underlying ESEA

CARD 3

- Restore rigorous teacher preparation at the IHEs—undergraduate/graduate levels for bilingual and ESL teachers
- Initiate guided self-reflective, self aware processes related to ELL education and ensure quality and equity
- Positive articulation, information for all stakeholders about what bilingual education is and the advantages for the nation to produce bilingual bicultural citizens for the 21st century
- Restore dual language programs to develop the citizenry that will have equality of opportunity to all opportunities of employment.

CARD 4

- Start training all school stakeholders who have ELLs in their classroom and include administrators. Educate, educate, educate
- Start educating ELLs and do not wait until they learn English at the advanced proficiency level. They should continue to learn on the first day they are in our classrooms. Stop making excuses
- Start to use assessments in the native language and use these to determine students' strengths and use data to drive instruction.
- Start recognizing effective bilingual and dual language programs city, state, and nationwide.

CARD 5

- Contrary to what most panelists believe, I think the most important skill to focus on (on the high-school level) is writing. In my experience, it's been writing, writing, writing über alles that has most helped ELs become proficient in English. That includes the writing of essays and research papers.
- I also believe it's necessary to prepare all teachers and school administrators to understand and learn to use the skills and strategies required for helping ELs attain English language proficiencies.

CARD 6

- Preschool recognition of the need for ELL programs. Totally needed!
- Academic language in all content areas!

CARD 7

- Advocate multi language education
- Develop developmentally appropriate practices for ELL preschool students.
- Testing—diagnostic not punitive
- Educate legislators/political leaders

CARD 8

- Start educating the current and future leadership in the school—teaching them the truth about bilingual education and supporting it.
- Start marketing the positives about bilingual education NATIONWIDE
- Provide incentives for schools to

CARD 9

- Include guidance counselors in trainings—effect on HS placement leading to negative results
- Follow lead of IL in ensuring bilingual and ESL in pre-K
- Ensure that home language questionnaire applies to pre-K as well as K-12
- Curriculum aligned resources for low incidence languages
- Start paying attention to how the CCSS will be adapted for ELLs
- Lots of lip service to their needs BUT no direct information/curriculum for them

CARD 10

- Bridging the gap between monolingual and bilingual teachers
- NL assessments
- Recruit more bilinguals to become teachers
- Validate bilingual education value
- Preschool bilingual ed
- Develop curriculum resources for low-incidence language groups
- Leadership training programs including understanding ELLs
- Training guidance counselors for HS proper placements

CARD 11

- Professional development for school personnel who identify and place children
- Pre-K—linguistically and culturally appropriate instruction
- Funding for native language curriculum and assessment development
- Promote multi-lingualism
- Develop curriculum and resources for low-incidence languages
- Align ESL with common core standards

CARD 12

- Have an EL specialist at the table at all federal DOE functions, policy sessions, etc
- Have a campaign for multilingualism (monolingualism can be cured) so the USA is not such an oblivious nation vis-à-vis other languages and cultures

CARD 13

- Keep the high standards for the hiring of prof. that serve ELL
- Keep focusing on technology or a [???] way or method to instruct ELL

CARD 14

- Require administrators and all staff to get certified/trained ELL needs and strategies.

CARD 15

- Start by having the administrators go to training for understanding how to work with ELL students

CARD 16

- More technology aiding the second language acquisition process in the schools---i.e. state of the art language labs
- More training for school administrators on the needs and resources available for ELLs
- Partnerships with the business/corporate world to institute programs that focus on moving ELL instruction into the needs of America in the future—Wall street needs to invest in this growing population.

CARD 17

- Having an ELL specialist at the table for national discussion on ed. policy
- Requiring training/prof. learning for administrators for best practices in ELL teaching
- Developing programs for SIFE students and alternative assessments
- Developing PK programs
- Funding assessments and translators
- Offering PK specific courses as electives in TESOL program

CARD 18

- Requiring better coordination/requirements between preschools (Head Start, public preK, private) and K-12
- Ensure teachers use formative assessments with ELLs—esp. performance based.
- Holding admin/schools accountable for ELL child outcomes using a growth model (à la RTTT requirements starting perhaps in “other” category and moving to “required”)
- Disaggregate ELL and ELL SpEd scores

CARD 19

- Decision makers need to understand ELLs and what works
- PreK programs for ELLs that incorporate native language
- Shift thinking to make bilingualism an asset and available to all students
- Teacher recruitment focused on native language speakers (outreach to minority language communities, teacher exchange)
- Train all adults in school settings (paras, aides, other staff) to support ELLs
- More translator resources and more translated tests

CARD 20

- Please provide more support for non Hispanic ELs, e.g. French, Haitian Creole, Arabic, Bengali, etc. Example—lets translate glossaries into French.
- More funding for program materials and after-school programs
- Analyzing tests for culturally biased questions—e.g. snowstorm pictures for NYSESLAT for Caribbean Island newcomers

CARD 21

- After we fix the wrong assessment issue for ELLs and support ELLs with the native language we need to initiate making our bilingual educators and administrators in the country and invest in training and professional development.
- Provide fellowships for teachers and administrators
- Provide financial support to the institutions to support our bilingual faculty.
- Invest in education
- Restore the Office for Bilingual Education
- Change the term ELLs to Emergent Bilingual Learners or Bilingual Emergent Learners

CARD 22

- Bridging the gap between monoling/ESL
- Native language established
- Train all employees with ELL population
- Start at preschool
- Teach the parents
- Test to help the teacher know where the student is and can help her place

CARD 23

- Start conversations between monolingual teachers and bilingual teachers
- Start training the school leaders on these issues

CARD 24

- Start training the guidance counselors so they can help parents/students for proper placement
- Start monitoring schools as surprise visits not one months notice. Monitoring if not expected weeks in advance could be effective. When they give them months notice it is a waste of money and resources. I say this from experience I have monitored for the state and federal government.
- Start training principals.

CARD 25

- Recognize PreK assessments are weak and not available in languages needed. We need OELA to provide guidance on alternative methods like portfolio assessments for preK and OELA needs to bring preK to the table as a stakeholder with unique needs.

CARD 26

- Step up for PRESCHOOL
- Improving teacher ed so ESL teachers learn how to meet learning needs of 3-4 year olds and gen ed teachers learn ESL strategies and spec. ed. strategies and spec. ed. teachers need to learn about ESL
- Then—address administrators

CARD 27

- Advocacy—we need to share our beliefs and passion on ELLs on a national level

CARD 28

- Start addressing issues such as PreK EL education, Nat. Am ELs, ELs in SpEd, ELs in Title I, ELs in rural settings, low incidence LEAs, newcomer programs
- Start developing formative assessments that include teacher observation/anecdotes and measure language more than once per year to assure programming is appropriate.
- Start sharing the responsibility for ELs—belonging to ALL staff—lunch lady to superintendent
- Start developing fair, valid assessments that measure what ELL students know and can do with language and content.
- Start developing alternate routes for graduation that do not penalize students and schools.
- Start developing support for diverse populations to be certified or re-certified to teach in the US

CARD 29

- Restore Title 7
- Train administrators about ELL teaching practices and needs of population
- Alternatives to those who don't aspire to higher education—need trade

CARD 30

- Bridging gap—breaking down barriers between bilingual/ESL and mainstream classes
- OELA -> OBEMLA. NCELA -> NCBE

- Required teacher preparation include requirement for administrators, superintendents (leadership academies too)
- PK programs include native language or second language instruction
- Multiple pathways to success (Broaden our concept of “success” and “achievement”)

CARD 31

- Training for administrators
- More funds for ELL programs
- Start PreK programs that are researched for ELLs
- Alternate testing for ELLs
- Appropriate placement and explain to parents
- Provide tests in other languages

CARD 32

- Disaggregate data according to ELP level
- Begin campaign to promote multilingualism
- Educate administrators and ALL staff to work with ELLs
- What are “best practices” in ESL education? Program models for bilingual/dual language?
- Need research and evidence-based learning
- Need campaign for preschool high quality for dual language learners
- Create assessments with new common core standards that have universal design so they can accurately and effectively measure the content knowledge of ELLs
- Needs of ELLs need to be considered while they are designing these assessments, NOT AFTER.
- Current accommodations are not valid.
- This accountability formula HAS to change. It is damaging schools and children!!

CARD 33

- Designing preK programs for ELLs using research in 2nd language acquisition theory to implement linguistically and culturally appropriate instructional models.
- Providing guidance to districts on the education of ELLs.
- Developing and implementing programs that address the needs of SIFE.
- Educating ALL school personnel in 2nd language acquisition theory including strategies to use with ELLs.
- Promoting appropriate cultural competency training.
- Developing standardized alternative ELP assessments for ELLs with disabilities.
- For AYP purposes, start disaggregating the data from standardized assessments to separate ELLs w/ disabilities from ELLs that do not have disabilities.
- For AYP purposes, start disaggregating the data from standardized assessments to separate SIFEs from other ELLs.
- Start working with IHEs to incorporate required research based course work for teachers, administrators, paraprofessionals and support personnel on ELLs for any degree and/or certificate-bearing program.
- Providing funding for translators, and translated tests in major languages, for high stakes content area testing.
- Stop using instructional time for scoring language proficiency and other high stakes tests.
- Using the current research for developing policies on assessment and program implementation for ELLs
- Providing funding for the scoring of ELP assessments so that this work can take place outside of instructional time
- Providing research based practices and models for ELLs in persistently low performing schools
- Need national ELP standards and national ELP assessment

CARD 34

- Asking that programs provided to ELLs meet Castañeda
- Disaggregating data on ELLs with disabilities
- Restore funding for BE and BspEd fellowships for: teachers; administrators; clinicians (speech, school psych, SW)
- Create benchmarks based on years of service.

- Begin promoting and funding dual language programs because they produce the greatest long term results (e.g. graduation rates) and students prepared for global society.
- Honoring the languages students bring with them (not languages they “come from” and often must “leave behind”)

CARD 35

- Alternate assessment
- Program fidelity
- Respect recommendations made during the IEP meetup, i.e. provide bilingual ed. if that was the recommendation

CARD 36

- Start training administrators
- Start allowing our students to live without fear of deportation and failure.
- Start funding for translating assessments

CARD 37

- We should start publicizing the benefits of bilingualism and multilingualism with respect to academics, economics, culture, finance, art—all areas. Once US citizens understand the value of multilingualism, jobs and college programs will be created to support the development of dual language programs.

CARD 38

- Bridging gap between monolingual and bilingual staff
- Teaching the students who are actually sitting in our classrooms. Teachers need to differentiate for ELLs.
- Push to make sure ELLs are represented at national levels.
- Finding ways to make multilingualism a national value.
- Include national ESL/bilingual organizations in this conversation.
- Administrators need some prof. development about ELLs

CARD 39

- Train regular ed. teachers with good ELL strategies not just for the EL students in their classrooms but also for the students who are exited from ELL programs and low income whites who are language deprived.
- Gather research data in areas that show consistent high performance.
- Pick core programs that have strong ELL components.

CARD 40

- Start recruiting teachers from the same community the EL students are from.

CARD 41

- Cultural competency, ESL, and general language access trainings for all school administrators and personnel
 - On the school level
 - On the district level
- Encourage community school models to make neighborhood public schools centers where parents & families can come for services, information
 - Increase parent engagement & support for students by making adults present in the schools

CARD 42

- Content area teachers, school personnel administrators – in school and district must know about ELs & language acquisition culture
- Testing needs to be reviewed to be more culturally grounded
- Develop a campaign to instill in the US the value of Bilingualism & Multilingualism
- Policy makers need to be accountable to know – public schooling language learning to make decisions. Communities need orientation to make informed decisions about leaders.

CARD 43

- We should establish programs for ELLs from kindergartens. If we are to have successful bilingual students, we need to start from the beginning. Research shows that the achievement GAP starts in kindergarten.

- We should strive to a national goal to Multilingualism. The world has become a globalized environment and other countries are [can't make out word] of US on this thinking.

CARD 44

- Develop a Pre-K identification process for Pe-K potential ELLs.
- Develop a Pre-K programs for ELLs
- Campaign for multilingualism.
- Ensure that districts include ELLs in their districts educational plans.

CARD 45

- Requiring course & training for all educators relevant to ELLs.
- * Require that all policymakers, administrators, anyone making decisions about children actually spend time in classroom at least 1x per wk, month, year!
- Community Schools should be funded that involve the stakeholders.
- Preserve a space at the table for marginalized populations.

CARD 46

- Providing real hand on, practical professional development that leads to effective practicing of teaching of EL students.

CARD 47

- Incorporate portfolio assessments – teacher/school – designed performance assessment
- Require all teachers to have deep knowledge of how to support language & content development.
- Research on secondary education – too much is generalized from research on elementary education
- Expand collaboration within schools, among schools, and between & among schools & communities

CARD 48

- Native language and bilingual education restored.
- Guidance/PD to school districts and administrators and school level personnel
- More teacher preparation

CARD 49

- Need to promote more language programming initiatives at the state level that will support multilingual learning, to best prepare our students (across the country) for the 21st century.
- Need to create educational spaces in our public schools where children/students can learn more than 2 languages beginning in the elementary schools.
- Need to not only certify more teachers that are culturally sensitive and instructionally ready to address the needs of language learners But also ensure the universities and preparing and certifying more instructional leaders instead of just transactional leaders prepared to adequately address the needs.

CARD 50

- We must start viewing our English language learners as the assets they are to our school districts! They are a service of live social studies' lessons for our monolingual students. Their stories speak first-hand of civil war, religious intolerance, and global poverty – When our ESL students' (secondary level) voices are heard, we are ALL reminded of what a democracy is – we no longer take our rights for granted.
- We must start mandatory trainings for all K-12 school administrators on cultural diversity, on the realities of the lives of the ELL cohort they serve, and on the role the L1 plays in the development of the L2 & content area

CARD 51

- We need to start giving Building Leaders the info they need about ELL & Bilingual students so they (principals) can create appropriate program models for these ELLs.

CARD 52

- Radical change – paradigm shift from lang as problem to lang as service & right for all!
 - Start embracing rather than being afraid of bilingualism in classrooms, and in federal education legislation, labels,
- All teachers educators for BE
- Researching that alters pedagogy, not racist xenophobic poo structures

- Testing as diagnostic tool, not punitive in all lang
 - \$\$\$ programming, PD, teacher education
 - Administrators need to know about EB students & how to educate them
 - Focus on equitable outcomes – opportunities to learn
- Focus on process – not just outcomes “A pig don’t get fatter the more you weigh it”
 - Bilingual Pre-K!!
- Fear – langs, cultures, [can’t read word]
- Challenge for higher ed: make the university bigger, admin, institutes

CARD 53

- A radical paradigm shift whereby language is seen as a resource rather than a problem or liability
- Bring back the “B” in federal policy: OELA → OBEMLA, NCELA → NCBE where bilingual education is in the title of the law and is funded
- Provide ample funding for programming, professional development, teacher preparation and administrator preparation for ELs
- Administrators and all school staff need to know about emergent bilingual and preparation to work with them
- Instead of the current myopic focus on testing we need to provide opportunities to learn where all the supports for language learning are available (eg well prepared teaches, great materials, native language development, etc.)
- Pedagogy & policy driven by research and practices prove effective in the education of emergent bilinguals
- Allowing in our assessments multiple measures of student performance such as the portfolios used by the international high schools in NYC that show the progress of emergent bilinguals rather than solely outcomes
- Educate Obama and Duncan about the needs of this population
- Please listen to us and do something! Things couldn’t be worse, the DOE is destroying our programs and kids ... you must reverse some of the damage that has been done!

CARD 54

- Allow ELs to reach language proficiency before giving them a high stake test.
- Know well who we are dealing with (ELs) and how to approach them in terms of instruction and pedagogy.
- Make sure that administrators on each level bring their support and research tested resources to help students excel.
- We do not need a “big brother” watching” and ready to spank if something goes wrong, but a caring superior who can advise, direct, and demonstrate.

CARD 55

- We need to make this a birth to adult conversation focusing on the family and the community. I really like the Harlem Children’s Zone (Jeffrey Canada) model. We need to educate all members of the community. [card is signed, with email address]

CARD 56

- Bridging the gap between monolingual & bilingual teachers to determine best practices & sharing of knowledge, information, data & how it all affects student outcomes
- Providing assessment for NL
- Training administrators in the needs of bilingual & ELL learners so that they can choose the app programs for their schools
- Developing programs for SIFE students
- Educating all school personnel in second language acquisition
- Disaggregate 2 sets of data: Biling Ss & Biling SS w disabilities
- Study research implement prog that drive pedagogy
- Testing for diagnostic purposes & not punitive purposes
- Identifying personnel why can pace Ss properly using the LAB-R & NYSESLAT

CARD 57

- Start getting the best (and sometimes under-recognized) teachers into the schools that need them most (it's easy to be "successful" in a low-needs setting. Some of our best teachers are under-recognized because they are facilitating growth in a high-needs setting.
- Start thinking of MULTI-LINGUALISM as an asset to our country
- Kids need to believe in a FUTURE and see themselves as part of that future ... for some kids, this includes a path to citizenship
- Fund Our Schools – lack of funding creates animosity & reduces results
- Know where our kids START ... not just where they need to get to

CARD 58

- Requiring pre-service and inservice training for administrators in research-based instructional models for ELLs
- More research on what works for ELLs
- Developing programs to meet needs of SIFE students.
- Design preK programs that strengthen native language proficiency
- Earmarking funding for scoring of language proficiency assessments so teachers do not have to cancel instruction to score.
- Encourage connections between research universities and schools.
- Provide funding for translations of content-area tests.
- Allowing more time before ELLs have to take high-stakes assessments, especially in ELA.

CARD 59

- Need to have greater out reach to bilingual speakers to become teachers – from all languages
- Start training all teachers and administrators in ELL → need to train all preservice teachers
- Hold administrators accountable for supporting their ELLs with research based practices
- Design pre-K programs for ELLs that are research based
- Increase funding for preschool programs in general
- Restore funding for translators
- Programs need to focus on research

CARD 60

- Develop and implement Bilingual Pre-K programs in NYS
- Including Native Language assessments in schools' accountability plan.
- Develop multiple types of assessments that are aligned to evidenced based research.
- SIFE programs need to be implemented in order to address the gaps.
- Acknowledging Bilingual Education programs as cognitively demanding/challenging models for education

CARD 61

- Close the achievement gap
- Use alternative assessment
- Ensure that rigorous standards are implemented
- Align Common Core with ELP standards
- Promote bilingualism
- Promote professional development for administrators
- Develop PreK ESL programs
- Celebrate diversity. Promote tolerance. Embrace bilingualism.

CARD 62

- We know it takes 2+ years for English language acquisition when compared to monolingual students we need to start appropriately testing in ELA and not contradicting what we say and do
- We need to start collaborating more across the state/state on research and best practices
- Start implementing an appropriate 2nd language assessment – is it the NYSESLAT?
- Start looking @ secondary education and what needs to be done to help our teacher prep-programs as they will fact ELLs in their classrooms.

CARD 63

- TESOL extension (add-on certificate) for content areas should be more accessible!! & teacher friendly!

- Encourage content area teachers to earn TESOL certificate so they can provide better support for ELs in content area classrooms!!

CARD 64

- More research on 2nd lang acq - & design appropriate assessments for ELLs
- Look at how we assess ELLs
 - NYSESLAT is it appropriate? What info/data does it provide? Does it drive instruction?
 - ELA – what after 1yr? when it contradicts what we know about 2nd lang acquis & when it compares to mono-lings?
 - Math – is it content know we are assessing or language?
- Also – “Training future teacher candidates in their teacher prep programs”

CARD 65

- Understand that even if bilingual ed is best it is just not a realistic option for every district – small districts, rural districts, districts w/ heterogeneous populations of ELs will struggle to find staff and resources to provide bilingual ed to every single student. There are still instruction practices in English that can help ELs learn and thrive. The choice of bilingual ed vs. not is not always political.
- Start fostering conversations btw legislators and teachers to help each group understand that the other is not comprised of malicious imbeciles.
- Start providing more support & training to administrators and leaders at the state & local levels so that they can provide better support to their staff.

CARD 66

- Validating the profession
- Educating administrators about programs for ELLs
- Target national attitude about Biling Educ

CARD 67

- Educate the entire school community about the importance/value of ESL and bilingual education
- Design an assessment tool that is appropriate for students with disabilities

CARD 68

- Native language arts assessments
- Add native lang arts component to national standards
- More funding for additional programming – after school, Sat academies, summer school

CARD 69

- We should things to promote respect for teaching community in the American society by doing the follow up of the values that EL kids, especially Asian kids bring to the schools
- We need guaranteed and correct placement and EL kids in their classes
- We should provide support to the new comers dealing with their culture shock and communication needs in the schools for EL students.

CARD 70

- Pre school, developmentally appropriate practices, bilingual education should be started. Native language assessments should start as well as native language instruction needs to start in pre-school. Native language is not only Spanish!
- We should Start informing those who are not a part of our community so that we can see change!
- We should start as early as possible, as early as preschool!

CARD 71

- Bilingual language proficiency vs. learning disability (knowing the difference)
- Better assessment methods
- More research and data needs to be analyzed
- Research should come from the classrooms and this research should inform policy
- RTI – should start and be properly implementing it in our schools

CARD 72

- We should keep being resourceful w/ funding
- Initiative such as these conferences should continue Native language instruction should also continue, as well as language and vocabulary development across the curriculum and not only by ESL teacher. Native Language Arts needs to continue as well. Small size ESL classes, Satur-

day, tutoring, after school programs should continue. Teachers who are certified, experienced and bilingual should continue to be hired

CARD 73

- Look at ELLs that are in SpEd because Ts don't know when is language delay vs. lg aq.
- Better assessment for ELLs – NYSESLAT is insufficient children who pass English regents do not pass NYSESLAT
- Focus on data 2 resend – for instructional [can't read word] – Manhattan Bridges. This research and constructive practice Need more active research going for different econological niches given that there are given differences across schools even within same progs.

CARD 74

- Making sure the leadership [and] administration understand the research-based needs & supports for ELs through their own training
- Funding state/national assessments that are required but sap \$ resource [and] instructional time for scoring
- Using assessment to share with parents, classroom teachers, administrators
- Making sure all students get what they need regardless of label

CARD 75

- Create Native Language Assessments
- Pre-K programs for ELL's – Dual & Bilingual
- Advocate multi-lingual learning “not a bad word” Spanish
- Show the research/data of strategies that work for EL & all students
- Pre-school ESL & Bilingual Learning needs administrator
- Being Bilingual is Positive

CARD 76

- Start training all staff to be culturally sensitive to all students (including staff in the front office)
- Start the data sharing to prove effective strategies that work with ELs and then teach and practice those strategies to teachers allow time to reflect.
- Start changing attitudes that being bilingual is a positive thing that is essential for the 21st century. It is not only in diverse schools but in that training occurs. It should occur at all schools & should be ongoing.

CARD 77

- Creating & implementing valid native lang. assessments
- Developing initiatives for bilingual teachers from lang backgrounds other than Span to become certified (along w/ this – fund biling. Programs in lang. other than Span.
- Valuing bilingualism (or better yet, multilingualism) for all students (including native Engl speakers)

CARD 78

- Work tirelessly to develop a national campaign to promote multilingualism as an AMERICAN value
- Native Language Assessments
- Funding for translators & seek out native language tutors
- Promote cultural competence training in conjunction w/ bilingual ed. Programs
- Bridge the gap btwn monolingual/bilingual instructors, model best practices
- Increase outreach to bilingual

CARD 79

- Start educating all school personnel in language acquisition
- Provide guidance to districts on ELL

CARD 80

- Give guidance to districts on how to do EL education & educate all school personnel around second language acquisition
- Start pre-school programs for EL students coupled w/ assessments in English & native language to make sure kids do not fall through cracks.

CARD 81

- Restore OBEMLA from OELA

- Train guidance counselors and administrators for appropriate placement of ELLs in schools.
- Disaggregate data for SIFE/LEP-SpEd.
- Develop NL assessments.
- Need preK bil. programs—research based—follow IL.
- Develop curriculum aligned materials for low incidence languages.
- Common core standards pay very little lip service to LEP/ELLs—how will they be implemented? PLEASE do something to REALLY include LEP/ELL's needs—example: how to develop content vocabulary (needs are different from monoling. students).

After the meetings, two more cards were submitted by one individual.

We should stop

Mixing students with limited prior schooling (so-called SIFE or SLIFE) with other beginner ELs. They are not familiar with Western-style formal education and need a different approach to transition them to it. If we understand their learning paradigm & create a mutually adaptive paradigm – with elements of both ours and theirs – it will work better.

We should start

Viewing students with limited prior schooling (so-called SIFE or SLIFE) as different, not deficient – as learners with a different learning paradigm, one that does not necessarily include literacy or formal education, but that allows them to learn if we incorporate their learning paradigm into our instruction.