

Kiva Process: Los Angeles, March 7, 2011

Round 1:

**What should we stop doing in EL Education?
What current classroom/school practices and policies are disadvantaging EL students
and getting in the way of their academic progress?
What ought to be eliminated?¹**

CARD 1

- We should stop assessing ELL students within the wider context of the English speaking population
- We should stop determining fluency/literacy needs of English language learners without consulting them and their constituencies.
- We should stop developing and implementing approaches predicated on funding – it should be the other way around – fund programs that evidence academic/civic/social gains

CARD 2

- Stop assuming teachers have the training and experience to work with ELs – especially as the EL population changes with each generation
- Stop low expectations for the academic achievement of EL students
- Stop misuse/abuse and misinterpretation of tests
- Stop thinking of the US as a monolingual nation we are expiring to with EL education
- Stop states implementing damaging policies and ratifying harmful accountability plans. Stronger peer review process for Title III

CARD 3

- Stop segregating students by language (Spanish) in the form of bilingual classrooms.
- The “bilingual model” comes from the 1960’s methodology and we continue to keep these students isolated with one teacher all day. There are many models to choose from – let’s move out of the 60’s.
- Stop testing teachers with (TPA’s) Teacher performance assessments and other assessments CSET’s. This does not make better teachers, but it does keep out our Latino population from going into teaching. Our Latino population does not do well on testing.

CARD 4

- We should stop increasing the number of measures implemented in the classrooms and school Districts without looking carefully at effectiveness
- Stop assuming teachers – Professional Development stops once teachers are in the classroom
- Stop assuming one size-fits all for the types of programs and structures that ELLs need – ELLs needs are different based on who they are / resources available to them / time in this country etc.
- Stop making funding a race (as stated at my table) ALL Children deserve access and equal support in all resources even funding.
- Stop assuming that ELLs are only children that are first generation or new to this country

CARD 5

- Stop, Teach for America students need Best Teachers. Not being taught by those who are learning how to teach & what to teach. Our students are not Guinea Pigs

CARD 6

- Stop throwing students into classrooms with teachers who have no training for teaching ELL

¹ Those who participated in the *National Conversation on EL Education* that took place in Los Angeles may notice changes in responses reported for two individuals in this round (Card 3 and Card 12); these changes were requested by those individuals after reviewing the first draft of this document. In addition, typographical errors that do not reflect what individuals wrote have been corrected.

CARD 7

- Stop assuming that effective Teaching is taking place and monitor implementation of best teaching practices.
- Regular walk troughs must take place to eliminate so much workbooks for EL

CARD 8

- CELDT assessment in Fall but results in FEB. don't effectively guide master plan, placement nor instruction for EL students
- Reading First Protocols where Teacher lectures to students – No Checks for understanding, nor engagement strategies for EL Students
- Avoiding holding teachers accountable for implementing best practices and new strategies that are proven to reach EL students
- Implementing new programs without proper staff development and ongoing monitoring with support
- Assuming teachers and administrator know and have internalized Best practices for EL learners.

CARD 9

- Our table discussed a few interesting points. The one that stood out to me the most is to stop thinking that children will learn a language in a year or two. Research has shown us that language acquisition takes much longer than that. Why do we continue holding children to that standard?
- The other topic of conversation I appreciated having was to stop seeing the student's first language as a problem. If we used their first language as a tool to learn other languages we would make more progress and create a multilingual community of learners.

CARD 10

- Stop crating separate reform efforts that do not reflect a Comprehensive integrated Focus on the needs of all students

CARD 11

- Stop separate PD offerings that do not relate to larger general education supports

CARD 12

- Treating ELL's second language like a disability, but rather view it as an asset that will benefit them & others in the class
- Allowing administration and principals who have no training or experience working with ELLs to be responsible for school(s) with significant population of ELLs
- Assigning ELLs education to certain school staff (like the ELL teacher) and not having all teachers be responsible for all students
- Teaching ELLs in a one-size-fits-all approach that does not take into account the different needs of individual students
- Having inconsistent measures of ELL proficiency and the ID process

CARD 13

- Teachers having low expectations of the ELLs
- Assigning teachers with little or no experience to classrooms that could benefit from an experienced teacher
- Providing little of insufficient resources to schools with high needs this includes books, technology, equipment, libraries etc.
- Unrealistic expectations for students when administering assessment, whether it is statewide, language assessment etc.
- Thinking that one year of school of formed English language instruction will make your ELLs proficient in a second language

CARD 14

- "One size fits all" curriculum that assumes ELs will become proficient in 4 year packaged scripted programs
- "One size fits all" professional development that lacks continuity and context
- Implementing programs that do not take into consideration the unique needs of the student and the community

- Overwhelming inexperienced teachers without necessary support, coaching, mentorship, preparation
- Assuming teachers lack the experience to determine an EL's proficiency
- Relying on outdated, inappropriate assessments to measure proficiency

CARD 15

- Stop using AYP as a punitive measure and not use only one standardized test to measure achievement. We do need to have accountability but use formative assessments that target our students. We are over TESTING even in formative testing.
- We need to stop putting out lists of "providers" who are qualified to do professional development. Professional development need to be collaborative & ongoing.

CARD 16

- Stop making education funding a "race"
- Stop assuming that teachers prep is done after student teaching
- Stop allowing P.D. to be optional when it comes to best practices for ELs

CARD 17

- Assessing students to death
- Treating school departments as silos - Everybody should know all student needs & work on how we can best serve them
- Leaving the training of new teachers completely to universities (Eliminate the classroom between theory & practice)

CARD 18

- Stop having focus on assessments
- Stop teacher training programs that don't provide real classroom ELL experiences
- Stop assuming students have classroom academic language skills
- Stop one size fits all processes

CARD 19

- ELD should be a part of regular content classes
- We should not use standardized test which are based on expectations of native speakers
- Decision about teaching strategies and curriculum should be research based
- The primary language of the home should be valued and be a part of the curriculum

CARD 20

- Stop CELDT testing in the fall
- Stop assuming teachers & administrators are implementing best practices (Monitor & Follow – through)
- Stop using only seniority to reduce teacher workforce

CARD 21

- Not involving our EL parents
- Not focusing on EL goals as an overall priority
- CELDT testing in the fall. Have another "initial" EL assessment for new students
- Allowing initiatives that allow EL focus as a "may"

CARD 22

- Stop narrowing the curriculum for English learners. Language needs to be learned & developed with the context of different context areas , not solely in an ELD class
- Stop the use of assessments that cannot be used to diagnose & prescribe effective instructional strategies to further develop a student's language development

CARD 23

- Stop the earl literacy approach that permeates the national focused on small elements of literacy with little or no emphasis on oral language development actually reading books
- Stop thinking of ELs as a homogeneous group & designing one program, & instructional practices for that singular profile
- Designing reforms that don't have EL at the core
- Stop approving state plans that don't rigorously address ELs

CARD 24

- Looking for a "silver bullet" (one solution) for all the issues that face ELs and educators

- Assuming that all teachers of ELs are certified / prepared to meet their educational language and content needs
- Making cultural and linguistic teaching skill courses in schools of education (teacher preparation) optional

CARD 25

- Stop assuming that one solution will work for all ELs and that all ELs fit one profile
- Stop implementing programs design for mainstream students for use with ELs in primary grades who are at Beginning and Early Intermediate levels of proficiency

CARD 26

- Stop assuming there is a silver bullet, one size fits all approach to educating EL students. It is complicated& not easy – such as ids becoming proficient in one year
- Stop thinking there is on Profile of the EL student
- Stop thinking that having an EL credential is enough to ensure quality instruction – professional development is critical

CARD 27

- Thinking that the capabilities necessary to integrate into a monolingual English classroom are solely academic. Test scores cannot be the “be all end all” of determining a students success. Proficiency is not only academic but social as well and we need to stop relying solely upon testing that may not, and in my opinion does not adequately describe a student’s needs and capabilities

CARD 28

- Stop high stacks testing of ELL on native language norms
- Stop low expectations of ELLs
- Stop improper testing of ELLs
- Stop initiating new funding programs / initiative that do not solicit input from people working on the ground first

CARD 29

- Stop teaching EL Students along with (or to compare proficiency with) native students
- Stop making “business-related: decisions when pertaining to educational development
- Agree – Stop creating new structures

CARD 30

- The outright crime of letting state, counties/locals districts get away with NOT abiding by Lau vs. Nicholas.
- The Federal laws that were put into place for all ELL’s and Educators instructing them.

CARD 31

- STOP having CELDT testing (both initial annual) given in Sept (30 day after school begins)
- Have 695 students (K-5) to test primary in Kdg- (not assessed timely)

CARD 32

- Assuming that the schools administrators and staff know how to work with EL students.
- Stop testing students at the beginning of the year.

CARD 33

- STOP=thinking that life is better served by being an acronym-i.e., “ELL”

CARD 34

- Stop segregated process in Arizona.
- OELA needs to stop funding & supporting unproven methodologies - not researched based - intervene!!!!
- Stop allowing parents to not be inside the classroom “ignoring”
- Stop “segregating” the kids
- Stop exesive assesment/unnecessary assesment
- Stop premature evaluation
- Stop ignoring the classroom teacher and STUDENT feedbacks.

CARD 35

- Stop looking at stand test scores as only measure of success-CA-Eng-only
- Labeling EL’s as disadvantaged

- Ignoring educ gap between low socio-econ families/students & upper SES ie/preschool/family literacy programs.

CARD 36

- We need to cease building silos....silos representing teachers of content. Silos for teachers of language development. We still hear subject area teachers saying "I teach content and I don't teach language" we hear ESL teachers saying "I teach language I don't teach content." We accidentally started this silo construction quite some time ago when we created special ELL, Bilingual Ed, Migrant Ed, Title I. These decoupled programs/silos had their own monies, directors, teachers, materials students. We need to bust open. These silos bring everyone into the mainstream with EVERYONE RESPONSIBLE FOR ALL STUDENTS.

CARD 37

- We should stop assessing ELS using the same standards as we use with native English speakers.
- We should stop reinventing the same thing over and over again.

CARD 38

- Stop cutting education funds
- Stop testing kids that cannot demonstrate their skills through testing (or testing them for a profit)
- Stop being passive in the education system.

CARD 39

- Stop devaluing bilingualism
- Stop financial di-vestment of education at all levels
- Stop the low expectation of ELL
- Stop segregating ELL students.
- Stop low-expectation of parent involvement of ELL students.

CARD 40

- I think we need to stop assuming that teachers and administrators know the difference between ELD and ELA. They are very different. Just because children receive instruction in English this does not mean they are receiving academic instruction in order to support their English language development.
- Stop doing CELDT in October.

CARD 41

- Stop low expectations of EL students
- Stop putting student in low classes
- Teachers low expectations
- Assuming that all administrators know what should be going on in an ELD classroom.

CARD 42

- Stop taking money away from schools
- Stop allowing districts to make up their own requirements for re-designation. There are disparities from district to district.
- Stop low expectations.
- Stop testing in October or the Summer
- Stop assuming teachers and principals know how to service EL learners.
- Stop asking EL students to take bias high stake tests.
- Stop ignoring the fact that accountability is being done. Who is monitoring schools and teachers.

CARD 43

- Stop doing low expectations
- Narrowing the curriculum
- Not emphasize early transition
- Stop not including STS in site & district evaluations.
- Teachers unions need to stop putting up barriers to terminating poor teachers

CARD 44

- Stop talking and start doing.
- Stop expecting all these items that are dumped on the school -CORE -Testing -Pacing Guides - H.S. exit exams
- Stop putting our EL with new inexperienced teachers.

CARD 45

- PLEASE! Stop assuming that school districts know what they are doing. Students' lives are being affected by poor administration. We need more advocates and auditing at the district level. STOP administering CELDT in the fall.

CARD 46

- Stop with low expectations for our English learners. They deserve quality programs in language, to include reading, writing, speaking and literacy. They need a strong foundation in learning from professionals who are prepared (in every way) to meet their needs.

CARD 47

- Revisit the "optional" position for ELL focused programs, in the competitive process for the DOE's Race to the Top. It should be mandatory.
- CA CELDT testing should be done at the end of the year, and not at the beginning.
- Uniformity in reassessment testing.

CARD 48

- We should stop racially segregating English learners in pull-out programs that deprive them access to the core and to opportunities to socially-construct language in high-quality interdisciplinary project-based classrooms. School leaders (principals, parents, gov't, community, members) need to lead the way with hope, faith, joy and evidence of student learning.

CARD 49

- Having low expectations from ELL. They are able to learn if a quality education is provided to them.
- Telling ELL need to be taught in Spanish, although they are born here (USA)
- Funding programs/curriculum has shown lack of progress.

CARD 50

- Stop to funding school districts who doesn't have longitudinal data to track E.L.L.

CARD 51

- Our focus on programs as the "cure" for what ails our student and teachers and refocus our attention on the assets that both teachers and EL students bring to the learning equation and to build upon the assets of both.
- Our priorities of improving test scores and instead view powerful teaching and learning as central to improving student achievements.
- Viewing language as the problem and see it as a treasure, understanding that the more languages we have under our belts, the richer we are.
- We need to genuinely examine what is occurring in classrooms in order to monitor compliance with Title I & Title III and stop believing an authentic view of compliance can be obtained at the state, the district, or even the principal level.
- We need to stop believing that effective parent involvement is attending meetings and signing off on budgets.

CARD 52

- Stop assessing students on high stakes tests in a language they do not understand.
- Stop tracking EL students
- Stop placing EL students in intervention classes as a first step.
- Stop 10w expectations of EL students
- Stop ignoring the importance of a student's primary language: culture.

CARD 53

- Stop accepting and approving English learner improvement plans that the state does not intend to monitor and as a result LEAs apt not to implement. The plans are often good, but "will" does not always exist or is manifested around doing the hard work that goes into revising master schedules to include ELD for all ELs, development or purchase of ELD assessments, SDAIE training for teachers etc...

CARD 54

- Stop putting EL policy in writing and not holding schools accountable.
- Putting forth different EL programs i.e. es and sec (ms/hs) without any continuity/bridge to close their gaps. Linguistic/instruc.

- Leaving teachers who are not highly qualified to teach ELs.
- Making it appear that our ELs are receiving good first instruction.
- Just going through the motions when providing parents information on the different instructional programs available for ELs.

CARD 55

- Stop using secondary research to apply to elementary curriculum development and vice versa
- Giving EL's to newer, less prepared teachers.
- Assuming it only takes 2-3 years for a student to meet proficiency.
- Training only select teachers on EL strategies, entire school should know.
- Putting principals/admins. In schools with large portion of EL's who didn't teach ELs. They can be instructional leads.
- Using different measures/tests/home language surveys to identify EL's.
- Having EL's "pulled out" for instruction to EL classes.

CARD 56

- Stop assuming that all EL's needs are the same from different cultures, language, generations.
- Assuming that because we were once trained in our teacher program we do not need more training on how to teach ELLs, SDATE
- Denying our ELLs from science, social studies, the Arts. We need content based ELD.
- Providing ELLs for only one hour of ELD/SDEL instruction. It should be at least one hour with content based.
- Assuming that all districts are meeting the needs of their ELLs learners.
- Stop being passive about bringing ELL's issues to the table- welcome and embrace process such as this one and support efforts of CABE, CASLS, California Forum?, ACSA and support them and hold them accountable for continue to bring ELL...[illegible]

CARD 57

- Stop considering ELS in the EL subgroup for AYP post reclassification w/o providing continued support for them.
- Stop moving forward initiatives that do not have English Learners at the core prior to adoption-ex. Common Core stds, Race to the top
- Stop inappropriate use of assessman ex: CELDT in fall. Standardized measures that hold ELs to proficient grade level standards or use of assessments not normed on ELs that over identify ELs for remedial or intervention programs.
- Stop the "one size fits all" approach to education ELs cannot be expected to meet standards within the same # of school days and 13 years of school.
- Stop defacto segregation and tracking of ELs - denying them access to science, social studies, arts, etc
- Stop differential accountability systems for charter and public schools. Monitor EL's in charters.
- Stop professional development requirements for teachers without providing adequate time for professional development.

CARD 58

- Stop the lengthy process of firing staff.
- Stop holding staff accountable for areas beyond their scope of practice.
- Stop lowering standards so everyone can pass. This is like the housing bubble, where many people were able to buy a house, but really had no business buying one. We are in an educational competition of sorts, and must strike a balance between fairness and practicality.

CARD 59

- STOP blaming the teachers!
- Stop saying silent about your (NATIONAL-OELA) position for EL's in the media.
- STOP Reforms/Policies that do not meet the needs of EL students.
- STOP Testing kids on items that are not necessary nor helpful to teachers.
- STOP structured programs that treat kids like robots (one size fits all)
- Stop pacing plans
- STOP eliminating the Arts/Science/Social Studies curr.
- STOP allowing right wing nuts from setting the agenda.

- STOP saying \$ is not the answer.
- STOP assuming teachers of EL students will modify or template EL materials for their classrooms.

CARD 60

- Stop – Having the children/EL learned without been std. assted.
- Stop – profiling kids by their last name
- Stop -- ES Instructors should understand the background of the students to adjust the program to the students needs. (There are students with their own native limitation.)

CARD 61

- Expecting a program, agency or legislation to have the answers to teaching kids who come into our classrooms with a different language and/or culture that “the norm.”
- Transformative work is hard messy work that is “solved,” by those of us embedded in the hard work.
- Profiling students based upon their last name. Just because my last name is Johnson it does NOT mean English is my primary language and conversely, Chung does not make Mandarin my L1

CARD 62

- Allocating funds within our budgets (national, state, district or school site) to programs that are incongruent with ELL students.
- Making quality, differentiated instruction optional! (Especially with ELL students.)

CARD 63

- A) Stop developing educational policies that are driven by anti-immigrant fear sentiments, which tend to impose models & practices that are not centered around the students’ needs.
- B) Stop seeing bilingualism or multi lingualism as a deficit.
- Stop evaluating students with assessments that are not valid & reliable for English learners.
- Stop assessing students in the fall, because the results are not as useful by the time they are received.

CARD 64

- Accountability is more important than quality instructional practice.
- Time for English language development is too short with accountability too quick.
- Respect for culture includes language stop ignoring this.
- Stop assessing students with a too short time frame for student success.

CARD 65

- We need to stop a nation-wide educational approach that promotes monolingualism. Bilingualism and multilingualism should be a core desire that we want for all students. If this is at our core as we design the educational system of our future, our ELs will have a more supportive structure in which to learn their second language.

CARD 66

- Believing that a simple CLAD qualifies any teacher to teach Eng lang. Development. Sometimes, these teachers are not even lang. teachers.
- Stop assigning least qualified & experience teachers to Eng. Learners.
- Current belief system (we must have high expectations).
- Setting our kids up for failure
- Assessing//testing/giving standardize testing to beginning Eng. Learners.
- Placing students in classes of teachers who have not been trained to work w/ Eng. Learners
- One size fits all

CARD 67

- Having low expectations of English Learners.
- Devalue ELs’ native language(s).
- Using a single English proficiency test for multiple purposes.
- Having unprepared teachers teach ELs. (in how to teach English as a second language)
- Allow ELs to “fall between the cracks” and fail.

CARD 68

- Stop devaluing the home language of ELs.

- Stop using practices that have the teachers as the sole experts in the classroom.

CARD 69

- STOP teaching to the test
- STOP separating content from language development/learning

CARD 70

- Subtractive schooling where we do not take into account what the child brings to the classroom.
- CELDT assessment in the fall.
- Binding CELDT to CST. Each should be a stand alone.
- Ignoring the fact that bilingualism is a good thing and require bilingualism for all of our students K-12
- Taking money from pre-school and invest more in early education.

CARD 71

- STOP prop “227” which doesn’t work.
- STOP Treating 2nd language as a “liability” or “defecit”
- STOP laws preventing ESL students go to college because their immigration status

CARD 72

- Please stop permitting educators to maintain low expectations for our English Learners.
- Please stop educators from lecturing to students as if they were “empty vessels” to fill
- Please stop the thread of creating “passive” learners.
- Please stop allowing our state to emphasize English as the only language of the/our great country.

CARD 73

- STOP giving the CELDT test on the fall. Students coming back from summer vacation had been at home with no preparation for the test. The test should be given to student at least 8 months into the school when teacher have been able to provide some type or review instruction for the test.
- STOP having low expectations for ELL’s. Teachers and school administrators should have same expectations for all students.

CARD 74

- Thinking first language Development/literacy Development interups learning second lang (English)
- Discouraging using ELL’s first language/literacy development

CARD 75

- Stop working with assumptions coming from a deficit model
 - Acknowledge home language
 - Support English development
- Stop assuming we know how English develops in sequential bilinguals
- Stop providing choppy/incoherent educational programs.
- Stop assuming that an EL though proficient will become comparable to monolingual English-speaking children.
- Stop using CELDT for proficiency, too superficial.

CARD 76

- Stop thinking that English language development (ELD) can’t be taught through content such as science and social studies. It can!
- Stop promoting and implementing early-exit transitional bilingual education as opposed to late-exit developmental maintenance or dual immersion program.
- Stop the exclusion of STS (Standardized test of Spanish/equivalent to CST) test scores in the California accountability system.
- Stop draconian sanctions against schools and move towards a growth model!
- Stop dismantling bilingual programs!
- Stop the exclusion of Science and Social studies.
- Stop using an invalid assessment instrument in California.
- Stop acting like charter schools are the panacea!

CARD 77

- Stop demonizing primary language other than English & bilingualism.

- Stop state & local policies that undermine research-based approaches to instructing ELLs.
- Stop instruction that is driven by narrow standardized test assessments.
- Stop preparing and credentialing teachers who are not prepared to meet the needs of ELLs

CARD 78

- Stop linguistic segregation of ELs
 - Placed in programs where they have no interaction with native English speakers from whom they can learn the language
 - Concentrated in schools with high % of ELs, with less prepared teachers and fewer resources than schools serving high % of majority students.

CARD 79

- OELA needs to stop not intervening in the Rogue state of AE who implements unproven classroom methodologies statewide that further segregate and produce failure.

CARD 80

- Stop defunding education. Do not continue to include public ed. In state and federal austerity measures.
- Stop narrowing education by focusing on standardized testing.
- Stop dividing public education by promoting charter schools. Too much emphasis on privatization of public schools.

CARD 81

- Stop
 - Denial of language and culture rights; “English only” policies; monocultural schools and curriculum.
 - Standardized instruction and assessments; early assessments for ELs.
 - Miss-diagnosis of ELs leading to unfounded “special ED” placements.
 - Profiling leading to low expectations/opportunities for ELs.
 - School-family “disconnect”.
 - Lack of poor pre-service teacher preparation on ENL/ESL.

CARD 82

- Stop
 - Belief systems that lend to misunderstandings → “EL stud. don’t do the work because they’re lazy. They are fluent!” In reality, many ELs may be fluent in social English but lack academic vocal/lang. to be successful. We need educators who understand this issue and are willing to teach our EL students.
 - Assessments that fit all → they are not a true represent .of EL achievements or EL progress.
 - Blaming the parents’ lack of participation for EL lack of progress. We can only control what goes on in the classroom. We need to teach ELs using best practices.

CARD 83

- Stop allowing unqualified & new teachers to work with ELs—hard to serve, needs add’l reward
- Stop the silence! Must talk about racial attitudes that get in the way.
- Stop passing policies that do not put ELLs at the core of the conversation (i.e. curr. adeptions, assessment policies)
- Stop testing in one language, all students assessed in two languages then the achievement gap charts might not look different.

CARD 84

- STOP DOING
 - Polarization — too many times we “knee jerk” to the problem
 - Separation—with any at-risk learner, connection to the ... [illegible] is critical.
 - Preventative problem-solving—How do we plan and accommodate for ELs rather than wait for the problem to appear?
- Higher Ed support—level the playing field in teacher prep programs so needed skills are not cut or lost due to the need of laziness [illegible]

CARD 85

- Stop thinking of a native language as a deficit!—Our poor attitude sets a course in motion that leads to the belief—“No, I can’t” and “No, they can’t or won’t.”

- Stop dictating time allotments in the classroom. The practice leads to very inefficient instructional practices—very linear approaches and very compartmental thinking.
- Not stop testing but rather be smarter and more efficient with testing. I think someone needs to take a closer look at the content of test questions—for example, elementary grade questions that have the same level of distraction as college level exams instead of simply understanding the concept.
- Stop having a “convenience store” approach to curriculum and strategies.
- Stop training folks to teach and then demand they ignore what they have been taught to simply read the script.
- Stop putting all the hopes into the “Plan”—great plans usually mean a huge amount of work in feeding the Plan instead of working with kids.
- Stop ignoring the research on brain that kids think from relationships, art, music.

CARD 86

- Stop incentivizing reclassification of students as a way of tracking their improvement
 - Should be more focused on the skill sets the student does have and stop passing the buck onto the next teacher or the next grade
- Stop letting charters go on unintegrated and unaccountable
 - They will keep coming up and should be monitored and held accountable to the students’ needs.

CARD 87

- Stop restricting teaching to what is tested
- Stop reporting language ability as a score. Describe it as what specific language skills students can or cannot do.

CARD 88

- Stop narrowing the curriculum. In CA there are school districts that put EL students in 2 or 3 periods of English and disallow them from taking history because it’s not tested in every grade. The lack of a history foundation widens the gap even further.

CARD 89

- Stop
 - Ignoring the needs of ELs within policies, programs, material development, funding appropriate research
 - Ignoring the race issue—provide cultural proficiency training
 - Ignoring the culture of low expectations.

CARD 90

- Stop assuming that ELD instruction is the responsibility of the ELD teacher or expert
- Stop implementing educational policy/regulations that do not include English learners at its core.
- Stop placing new teachers to teach the most needed.

CARD 91

- Stop sending teachers to districts who are:
 - Unprepared to teach the various populations
 - Unwilling to work with certain populations
- Stop blaming the parents and the children.

CARD 92

- Stop seeing knowing another language as a deficiency that should be treated using a medical interventionist model. This has led to negative characterizations of language and culture, isolation or quarantine strategies; and time limits by which not knowing must be cured.

CARD 93

- Stop
 - looking at language learners as deficit learners
 - using the language of funding “supplement, not suppliant” and applying to classroom instruction—classroom instruction should be refined for English learners not additional or more because educators can’t do much more
 - ignoring research

CARD 94

- Stop building and paying for programs and initiatives that do not support the students we teach as well as do not support the research on English learners.

CARD 95

- Create a culture where ELL student gains are celebrated even if these gains are not yet fully reflected in their test scores. Language acquisition is a process and every step forward is cause for celebration.

CARD 96

- Stop
 - Pushing out initiatives that are world of the educator voice [illegible]
 - Looking for a quick fix. Learning anything is a process!
 - Demoralizing students through test that do not test what they really know.
 - Leaving the parents and community out of the discussion.
 - Letting budgets or lack there of dictate best practices.
 - Working in silos. It does take a village to educate a child.

CARD 97

- Stop testing students onBenchmark Tests. Using them to view data at the beginning of the year, mid-year, end of the year to see how they do at the end of the year in the state assessment. The tests are also tied into school/teacher monies. So teachers start to basically loose focus on doing true teaching. Say, start teaching the test to make the gains.

CARD 98

- We need to stop looking at ELs as Spanish speakers. There are many language learners from many different counties coming to our schools.

CARD 99

- Stop
 - Viewing ELL as a deficit model. Multilingual abilities are an asset.
 - Initiatives that do not recognize or support ELLs.

CARD 100

- Discouraging parents from enrolling their children in programs designed to be linguistically appropriate
- Appropriate assessments—labeling students based on assessment results from inappropriate assessments
- Stop seeing other languages as deficient when planning programs
- Stop having administrators dismantling programs when their ideology is different than other research-based practices.
- Stop changing programs based on other factors that don't impact student learning rather than implementing programs that address the language and instructional needs of students.

CARD 101

- We should stop ignoring the urgency of the role Pre-K and family involvement play in the education and development of the child as a whole.

CARD 102

- Stop segregating kids by language groups for four hour blocks—cutting out content of math or/and science
- Stop looking at test scores as the only measure of success
- Stop labeling kids as deficient
- Stop thinking deficit model with kids who only bring one language
- Stop having ill-prepared administrators.

CARD 103

- Stop
 - Looking at the standardized test like the one and only one that determines the fluency measurement
 - Thinking that our EL should learn only one way
 - Assessment (some students take this type of assessment as a punishment)
 - Programs that principals don't know about it.
 - Creating new structures

- Being passive
- Approving proposals
- Testing our children before the school year ends
- Thinking that our EL parents do not care for their kids education.

CARD 104

- Stop building programs that ignore actual information about each student. For example, if a student has only beginning English language skills stop failing that student for being a non-English speaker. Stop ignoring language development needs of student and the related professional development needs of the teachers and of school leadership.

CARD 105

- Stop accepting policies/initiatives that don't support ELL needs
- Stop assuming that people know the needs and best practices
- Stop putting unqualified/new teachers to teach ELL students
- Stop ignoring the critical need to address ELL in quality education and future of students/kids

CARD 106

- We need to STOP thinking the solution is in any one program. We need to look at instructional delivery to ELs, what adjustments are being made to help assess the curriculum... We must stop going from program to program and start looking at the delivery of instruction, the implementation of strategies for ELs.

CARD 107

- Stop doing: "One size fits all education" → should have ... [illegible] and different ways to teach them.
- Current practices: Testing / this is very narrow assessment. In focus—not taking into account indiv. learning styles and cultures
- Eliminated: Teaching that does not take into account that this country is multi-lingual, multicultural, etc. Diversity and inclusion should be embraced and celebrated.

CARD 108

- STOP sending less qualified teachers and administrators to teach/administer ELL programs
- STOP being insensitive to the value of a student home language and culture.

CARD 109

- Stop the practices that we now know from research do not work. For example when Prop 227 was passed, thousands of children affected without consideration to the impact on the children. We now sit here and look so shocked that we have "lifetime" EL students. There is sufficient research that proves students need support of L in order to succeed, so why aren't we practicing what data shows will work?
- We talk about the toxic culture that exists in some schools that fail but what about toxic thinking that has led us to where we are. Bilingualism is an asset to us all. We need to have accountability and stop blaming children or teachers.
- Support+ Accountability=Success
- Stop sending money through grants without some accountability but think also of long term. You affect children's lives when you "yank " the money. Now for the "dip" but look for improvement.

CARD 110

- STOP Discounting STS (Standards Test in Spanish) for students participating in a waived program.

CARD 111

- Stop playing politics with education
- → do not allow anti-immigrant sentiment to determine school/policy + programming.

CARD 112

- Stop blocking parents into the process of informing them of the EL reclassification process
- Stop intimidation
- Stop making schools not welcoming.

CARD 113

- Stop make assumption about pacing guide, teacher-preparation for ELLs
- That bilingual Eng is a debility for student
- There is a silver bullet

Round 2:

What should we keep doing in EL Education?

What current classroom/school practices and policies are having a positive impact on EL students' learning and achievement?

What ought to be maintained?

CARD 1

- Keep categorical funding that is specifically allotted for English Language Learners to be spent for them. Too often schools think they can get away w/ spending these funds for the student population at large.
- Keep the parent advisory committees in place (ELACs, BPACs) in order to give voice to the concerns, priorities perceived by the parents of English learners but provide adequate training to coordinators, principal & parent leaders so that the committee function as they are supposed to.
- Keep promoting biliteracy seal in CA, to recognize biliterate student.
- Promote good & effective teachers, academic pgms, & SES pgms for English learners.

CARD 2

- I think that we need to continue the conversation around EL students to raise the level of awareness of who they are, % of LTEL appropriate placement of students and face the reality that we are not servicing this population of students. As the level of awareness is raised we will create an urgency and take steps to meet their needs.

CARD 3

- Continue funding for professional development for teachers of ELs in best practices
- Continue funding for Dual Language programs to support the nationwide shift in thinking regarding desirability of bilingualism in our citizens as an asset.

CARD 4

- Keep up w/ research on leadership – impetus for change
 - Shared, distributed leadership
- Expand immersion programs
- Funding dual – language programs – FLAP grants (foreign lang. acquis. Prgm.)
- Keep funding programs that inform them of EL policies, programs, etc.
- Keep informing teachers of “best practices” how to work w/ EL students
- Keep data-driven decision-making – build culture of inquiry.
- Keep good teaching (what we know already)
- Keep PD on understanding EL student population
 - Culture
 - How to instruct
 - Help counter deficit views of students.
 - Keep looking at student assets not deficits. Build on assist /funds of knowledge/culture capital.
- Keep engaging parents of EL/welcoming parents.
- Keep the EL conversations alive!

CARD 5

- Keep focus on Graduation rates [Endgame]
- Keep developing Leadership training programs.
- Keep developing shared leadership programs.
- Keep basing decisions & practices on best resource.
- Keep parent training & involvement programs.
- Keep NCLB subgroup focus.

CARD 6

- We need to keep supporting the professional development efforts of teachers of ELLs and of administrators who evaluate those ELLs. The expectations should be of the highest nature in the instructional program complementation phase. And, the teacher who gives the instruction and

the administration who evaluates those teachers need to be supported with high expectations and with the professional development they require to meet the needs of the ELLs.

CARD 7

- Professional development for all teachers, of English learners
- Leadership training
- Instructional practices that are giving results
- English learners in the forefront
- Funding for English learner prof. dev.

CARD 8

- Keep providing categorical funds for staff development.
- Keep discussing how can we best meet the needs of EL students
- Celebrate & develop capacity
- Keep process of ELAC – however train parents to be more informed participating
- Keep advocating for long-term learners and for access to college going curriculum.

CARD 9

- Access to other program, esp @ secondary level, such as art, music, electives, etc.
- Curriculum & pedagogy that is rich and relevant to the context of students, teachers, community's lived reality.
- Evaluating programs and using multiple measures, to judge effectiveness – not just student outcomes! Use multiple methodologies and mixed approaches.
- The professionalism of teachers. Trust their knowledge and experience in what is best for ELs.

CARD 10

- Keep funding for schools but use funding for ELL's to bring in more trained personnel. This could be using high school student who can earn money as high school tutors.
- Keep using research to complement programs a la "Dual Immersion." As well as this program works when implemented correctly we still do not have enough schools using Dual immersion.

CARD 11

- Funding for bilingual programs is crucial to the development and quality of a program we need to keep funding these programs and acknowledge that it takes more money and resources to keep them going. Part of that funding needs to be devoted to parent education to ensure their involvement and contribution to their child's education.

CARD 12

- We should emphasize Pri[mary] language instruction
- Keep a specific ELD time in curr.
- Emphasize rigor, engagement & creativity in classrooms
- Keep advocating for ELL's
- Keep providing specific P.D. for all teachers/Admin. Policy makers.
- Developing better assessments (informal & formal) for ELL students.

CARD 13

- With support of instructional leaders, Groups of inspired, collegial teachers who plan project-based & performance based learning for EL students.
- Evidence of student learning is shared to community. Also, keep funding and supporting Dual language programs.

CARD 14

- Keep investing in research to inform practice & policy
- Keep informing the public of the need to expand the teaching of many languages & cultures.
- * keep expanding the development of professional Learning Communities among teachers and other roles to help problem solve & improve instruction at the local level.
- Keep developing culture & equity issues and curriculums.
- Keep developing work on Differential Instruction to find making paths to meeting the needs of individual child.

CARD 15

- Categorical funds used for EL's, not closing general fund gaps
- Focus on instruction based on research

- Research for secondary informs secondary
 - Research for elementary informs elementary.
 - Students as focus for all decisions
 - Keep PD focused on EL needs, not as add on at end of math PD.
 - Rigor, using Blooms Taxonomy
 - High school graduation in mind for all decisions.
- CARD 16
- Dual language and bilingual programs
 - Objective third-party research and what does work.
 - Integrate various skills rather than teach them separately.
- CARD 17
- SUCCESSFUL Bilingual Programs that help ALL st[udent]s. - Specifically Dual Lang. OECA needs to take a stand and promote/fund these programs to be replicated. We don't need to re-invent the wheel!!! We need to re-design it aerodynamic to need the kids new era (technologically inclined)
- CARD 18
- Funding and Added Support for Dual Language Programs. This would help to support the idea that ALL kids come to the classroom with something to offer.
- CARD 19
- Connecting research to classroom instruction/policy
 - Focusing on the gap
 - Focusing on long-term EL's & strategies that work at secondary
- CARD 20
- Expanding the universe of ELs –
 - From separate classrooms -> mainstream of content teachers->administrators->school boards.
 - Who are aware of the needs & best practices in the world of ELs
 - Marketing research into EL experience growth, etc.
- CARD 21
- Keep Best practices e.g.
 - G.L.A.D. Strategies (Guided Language Acquisition Design)
 - Inquiry Projects
 - Balance Literacy & Biliteracy
 - Keep & Expand Dual Lang Programs.
- CARD 22
- Keep emphasis on developing opportunities for students to grow as multilingual citizens of the world.
 - Keep supporting programs that are “additive” and not “subtractive”
 - Keep supporting teacher Professional Development with emphasis on Differentiated Instruction for ALL students ALL teachers not just ELLs and teachers that teach in “English Only” classrooms.
- CARD 23
- Keep funding for Bilingual Dual Language programs
 - Keep funding for Prof. Development for sheltered instruction
 - Keep a focus on graduation
 - Continue focus on Long Term ELLs
 - Keep the conversation going.
- CARD 24
- Keep focus on EL needs
 - ELD class
 - DI programs
 - Funding
 - AVID
 - Teacher accountability

CARD 25

- Conversation around long-term ELL
 - Access to core content
 - Access & opportunity to college & career-readiness programs
- Training/capacity building of teacher & admin around best practices & achievement.
- Celebrating excellence when seen & learned.

CARD 26

- Emphasis on differential instruction

CARD 27

- Keep expanding funding for dual immersion programs
- Ldrship teams need include bilingual educ. specialist.

CARD 28

- Doing research into best practices for ELLs
- Providing training to ALL teachers to ELLs
- Funding/promoting/implementing dual language programs
- Emphasizing differential instruction, meeting the needs of each individual ELL
- In school reform, ensuring that ELLs are a part of planning from the start.
- Keep teaching English language acquisition through all subjects.
- Implementing programs that emphasize value of the ELL's first language.
- Teaching literacy in the ELL students first language.
- Using good teaching practices with ELLs.

CARD 29

- A focus on access to AP classes and high expectations.

CARD 30

- A focus on parent engagement.

CARD 31

- Keep up strong advocacy for meeting the needs of ELLs at all levels—school sites, district levels, state and federal
- Keep supporting programs that promote bilingualism (dual immersion, bilingual education, primary foreign language instruction)
- Keep supporting teacher prep programs that have the cultural and linguistic needs of ELLs as core.

CARD 32

- Continue with the conversation but we need to include the parents component especially when we talk about EL students.

CARD 33

- Recognizing cultural capital that our EL students and families bring.
- Funding programs for EL and dual lang. programs, i.e. FLAP grants
- Funding and implementation of PD on best practices for all.
- Keep this conversation going.
- Leadership training that includes EL and multicultural instruction.

CARD 34

- We should continue implementing practices that work. We should maintain literacy in at least two languages.

CARD 35

- Keep supporting those who, through the judicial system, challenge statewide practices that through voter approved initiatives, implement unproven methods as approved classroom practices for ELs.

CARD 36

- Keep having open-minded discussions as we are having now. We also need to include our parents in the type of discussion to have them be more academically engaged in their children education.

CARD 37

- Continue funding for dual immersion programs.

CARD 38

- Continue to push legislation that mandates and holds districts accountable to EL equity and academic achievement.

CARD 39

- Continue to use (gold standards) research to inform our work.
- Use STS as a measure of EL growth and eventually fold it into CAs accountability system.
- Promote PLC's driven by the needs of ELs to create structures of support that address the instructional needs of all students.

CARD 40

- Encouraging educators to collaborate professionally so as to never stop learning (PLCs).
- Keep English learner needs on the "front burner" (this field of research is quite young).
- Keep encouraging the use of student to student and student to teacher interaction.
- Keep providing professional development that is specific to EL student needs.

CARD 41

- Keep holding ELs to high standards and expectations.
- Keep funding various kinds of research (qualitative/quantitative/-).
- Keep focusing on ELs in policy decisions and research.
- Keep developing appropriate, quality materials for bilingual and EL programs.

CARD 42

- Continue to have high expectations for all subgroups.

CARD 43

- We should keep:
 - Dual language programs in practice because knowing multiple languages is not a deficit, it is a benefit to the community not only educationally but socially as well. If we want parents to get involved as much as possible, knowing we care about the culture and not only about the linguistic background of their children I believe will drive their passion to take part in this process.

CARD 44

- Keep heritage language/dual language/multilingual programs alive—keep funding for these programs
- Keep OELA/NCELA as a voice for ELs
- Keep research funding in this domain: Prof. Dev. studies, instruction studies, assessment studies for ELs.

CARD 45

- Good bilingual programs that develop biliteracy and expose ELs to challenging curriculum.
- Fund research on programs and assessments.
- Fund studies on fairness and validity of assessments for ELs.

CARD 46

- We should not be afraid to make changes even on things we want to keep.
- We should continue funding Title I and III but requires a longitudinal data to be attached to each district to track the ELL students progress.

CARD 47

- Making sure classroom teachers are a part of any discussion, decision, and initiative.
- Keep GLAD, SIOP, SDAIE trainings and expand
- Dual language programs in all areas of country
- Teachers must have a second lang. experience who teach ELs so they understand lang. acquisition process and students needs.

CARD 48

- It is important to keep PD that works (GLAD, SIOP, etc.) but ensure that it is fully implemented
- Keep assessment that helps to guide instruction

CARD 49

- Monitoring ELLs
- Commraderie and cooperative environment at work—team building
- Common commitments

- Professional development
- Research that is non-biased

CARD 50

- Recognizing benefits of multilingual approach—use evidenced-base/research base for programs/initiatives.

CARD 51

- Dual language programs
- Foreign language programs for all kids
- Research on LTELs
- P[rofessional] Development for all teachers on language acquisition, culture and equity
- OELA
- NCELA

CARD 52

- Let's keep strengthening leadership for ELLs. We know from research that leadership matters so let's make sure principals know that don't have to do it alone. Research shows the importance of leadership teams and when leadership teams include ESL, teachers [more] can get accomplished. Leadership teams can then make data-based decisions which affect ELLs rather than just the ESL teacher alone making all the programming and planning decisions.

CARD 53

- Research in the forefront to drive instruction and best practice
- Advocacy at all levels starting with the student!!!

CARD 54

- Continue the research on effective instructional practices.
 - Catherine Snow—vocab development
 - Kate Kinsella—writing development
 - Susanna Dutro —language development
- Also look at the research we have learned about language acquisition when we develop new policies, but keep in mind the child
- Continue funding dual language programs but expand them across districts not just sites because they work, but look at the accountability for others to model like programs
- Keep the funding long enough to see results.

CARD 55

- Professional development. Keep teaching what is working.
- Support instructional leaders and allow instructional leaders to be instructional leaders.
- Keep bilingualism.

CARD 56

- Keep research on best practice for support for “struggling ELs” in an RTI model
 - Be sure ELs are not being overidentified for remedial progress
 - Be sure measures that are not normed on ELs are used that are invalid and will result in overidentification.
 - Be sure that RTI programs and practices are appropriate for the needs of ELs.
- Keep going with support and funding dual language programs. I believe FLAP grants no longer support Spanish DL programs!
- Keep supporting development of parent outreach programs for parents of ELs.
- Keep going a development of appropriate instructional materials and/or differentiation suggestions within curriculum materials for ELs.
- Keep going to standardize measures and identification procedures that are consistent nationwide.

CARD 57

- Hold categorical program reviews
- Keep parents informed/ abreast of the EL status of their sons/daughters
- Fund programs and positions that advocate for ELs
- Hold EL conversations like the one held today!

CARD 58

- Have advocacy groups advocate as a community issue and not just as a organization issue.

- Keep on mobilizing the community of ELLs to advocate for changes at the local schools and districts.
- By having comm.. at ELL's advocating at the local level, there is a sense of monitoring at the local level.

CARD 59

- Develop programs that equitable and don't approve textbook programs that are not. I am talking about instructional textbook programs that are state board approved for English instruction and the Spanish version is approved but it's not equitable to the English version. When this is done the message is loud and clear: one is more important than the other.
- Research on bilingual ed.

CARD 60

- Strengthening monitoring systems, especially to guarantee that ELs are reclassified appropriately.
- Keep enforcing/strengthening accountability systems that track data
- Keep dual immersion programs (bilingual programs)
- Keep ELL as a critical component in having quality education
- Keep strengthening prof. development of teachers → best practices, esp. for ELL instruction.
- Keep-continue shared leadership.

CARD 61

- Keep expanding dual language and bilingual education to address EL access to content instruction.
- Keep emphasizing active parent involvement.
- Maintain a focus on long term ...[illegible]
- Emphasize instructional leadership of the Adm.
- Support the social/emotional needs of ELs and their families.

CARD 62

- Keep focus on graduation rate.
- Keep scientific research study to determine which programs to support
- Keep "parent involvement" as a focus on Title 1 program
- Keep ESL and teacher professional development as a key indicator for teacher quality.

CARD 63

- SHARE/Value successes of dual language programs/share models
- Sharing research in schools, basing programs on research
- Data collecting—not just standardized test, but also student products assessed with rubrics
- Exploring PD and teacher planning structures/teacher leadership structures in schools.
- Personnel and increase those who provide support for the social emotional needs of children and their families
- After school programs—and strengthen them! Enrich the opportunities afforded for all children

CARD 64

- Developing high quality administrators who know about EL education and enrichment bilingual education
- Networking with each other to share effective practices
- Keep advocating that primary language assessments are included in state accountability models
- Keep advocating for a comprehensive curriculum—science and social studies
- Keep doing Project GLAD to promote English language development through content such as science and social studies
- Keep having high expectations without unrealistic expectations
- Keep expanding dual immersion, late-exit maintenance, foreign language education, high school and middle school native classes (i.e. Spanish for native speakers).

CARD 65

- Validate the importance of the home culture, language and experiences
- Remind educators of the role of parents as teachers. In fact, they are their children's first teachers.

- Hold onto and grow more dual language immersion programs. In addition, hold steadfast to the critical components that must be inherent in these programs.
- Provide professional development for teachers that connects research to practice.
- Continue research going on the impact of programs and teaching practices on the achievement of ELs.

CARD 66

- Continue the funding and resources for the STEM initiative, more elementary teacher training programs in this discipline
- Continue the funding for professional development for teacher preparation programs and teacher workshops, etc.

CARD 67

- Keep focusing on differentiating instruction

CARD 68

- Keep doing
 - High expectations
 - Policy makers need to be informed regarding our plights

CARD 69

- Continue bilingual education options
- Continue education of bilingual teachers

CARD 70

- Early-on intervention that is effective in identifying a child's need so they don't continue to fall behind.
- Advocating bilingual education and encouraging not only English/Spanish but language appropriate depending on the community
- Encourage implementation of theory in the classroom

CARD 71

- Keep teachers who deal with both content and language.

CARD 72

- Providing support for students through all phases of language development
- Working to keep parents involved as partners in their children's education

CARD 73

- Keep DI programs
- Keep biliteracy seal
- Keep pushing for research on best practices for ELs

CARD 74

- We need to keep our focus on providing ELs access to a balanced curriculum (art, math, science, lang. arts, social studies) with lang. support embedded in the instructional delivery. Not only are the teachers responsible for planning a well-developed lesson but they also need to explicitly plan for lang. support.

CARD 75

- Keep emphasis on differentiated instruction so that it does not become fragmented instruction.
- Keep an emphasis on long-term goals, especially career- and college-ready graduates.

CARD 76

- Keep the regs and enforce them
- Keep assessment—but change format

CARD 77

- Keep data & break down data by subgroups.
- Need to keep subgroup accountability.
- ELD instruction
- Having a test that identifies & monitors yearly progress in language development (California).
- Keep targeted \$ for EL only for ELs
- Require evaluations of Title II grants
- Keep personnel-point person that coordinates & oversees programs for ELS at district levels has authority especially in high count districts.

- Keep federal v. state categorical funds v. guidelines.
- Keep a focus & emphasis in development of child's primary language.

CARD 78

- Maintain pt. person w/ sole responsibility to oversee programs for EL students
- Keep integrity of targeted financial assistance.
- Keep testing of targeted financial assistance.
- Keep testing EL students-but use valid & reliable assessments.
- Keep providing language assistance to ELS in special education-don't exit them.
- Maintain mechanism of accountability

CARD 79

- Shared leadership
- \$ for professional development
- Encouraging parent involvement

CARD 80

- Advocating for beneficial successful ELL programs
- Recruiting and retaining EL teachers
- Using reliable methods for evaluating and improving teacher preparation, professional development, and instructional strategies.

CARD 81

- Keep a focus on Long-Term English learners.
- Keep a focus on insuring that there is evidence that students are progressing adequately.

CARD 82

- Focus on grad rates
- Focus on leadership team membership and their input!
- Focus/fund current research
- Focus on parent piece-every aspect possible.

CARD 83

- We should continue to advocate for research based findings that promote sound policy & practice which supports best practices for EL's in a timelier manner.

CARD 84

- Offering programs that are research based and promote multiple languages.
- Promote parental engagement programs that work collaboratively with the school to increase student achievement.
- Promote the development of teacher prof dev & prep programs that prepare bilingual prog. personnel so we can have dual lang. prog.

CARD 85

- Engaging partners like parents to support high expectations for EI students
- Funding programs that we know work-prof development, differentiated instruction, AVID/GLAD

CARD 86

- Keep teacher education programs that sensitize future teachers to the diverse classrooms they will be in
- Keep collaboration between student, teachers, researchers (profs) and administrators in order for research funding to make it to the classroom and the children-teachers as researchers.
- Keep test practices that we know work. Glad, inquiry, themes, etc.
- Keep this kind of events with OELA.

CARD 87

- Monitor funding
- Keep focus on programs that are researched based
- P.D. for teachers-keep continuity
- Continue P.D. funding
- Support dual-lang programs

CARD 88

- Keep programs that promote cultural sensitivity

- Keep action research programs that promote collaboration between administration, teachers, students
- Keep having conversations on lowering the dropout rate and stop playing politics w/ education. Our “undocumented” students should have access to higher ed. Anti-immigration politics prevent these students from thinking that ed is important, or for them.
- Keep the emphasis on differential instruction to allow all student so access knowledge.
- Keep emphasis on professional learning communities to allow more collaboration for all stakeholders (this also does away with silos).

CARD 89

- Being positive, that our EL can succeed in school if we prepared and motivated teachers believe in them.
- Investing in students/teachers/adm and not to forget the parent component piece.
- Leadership programs
- Focus widely about EI students graduating from HS and pursuing post secondary education.
- Best practices

CARD 90

- Develop professional learning communities that have EL focus at core.
- Differentiate prof dev to assure all teachers have ELD skills and practice them from panning through instruction & evaluation of programs. Keep expecting teachers & districts to show long term results.
- RTI intensified differential p[rofessional] d[velopment] & instructional leadership.

CARD 91

- Continue emphasizing academic achievement of EIs
- Continue concurrent, and increasing language development of EIs as they learn academic content
- Continue providing ongoing professional development for teachers in research-based best practices for teaching EIs.
- Continue training of teachers and support of programs in bilingual programs, dual immersion programs and two-way bilingual programs.
- Keep recognizing that overall we are not currently meeting EIs’ needs in education

CARD 92

- Keep looking at successful programs throughout the U.S.

CARD 93

- Continue to use data-based decision making to drive instruction & hold folks accountable
- Keep dual/bilingual programs.

CARD 94

- Continue to keep & expand dual lang. prog. & foreign lang. access to others.
- Continue or renew grants funds availability to existing prog/sch. (FLAP Foreign Lang.)

CARD 95

- Keep focus on L1 & L2 development for preschoolers
- Keep Title III & state categorical funds targeted for EIs as supplemental funding - keep monitoring the funding & programmatic requirements.
- Keep advocating, funding, supporting dual lang. programs for all students.

CARD 96

- Assessments but make them align with real student needs
- Trying to collaborate with community organizations.

CARD 97

- Targetted school-based professional developments.
- Building of school-family partnerships.
- Higher ED/Schools partnerships
- Learning communities
- Advocacy
- Research and dissemination best practices.

CARD 98

- Let's keep working w/ collaboration making sure they are implementing the ELL system.

CARD 99

- Slipping in that de-bunks what Research and our community partners NCLR/MALDEF etc. say about NEA/AFT.
- What is right and good for ELL please. Please get fellow ELL ambassadors please look at all the ELL recommendations that were submitted to group lead by Eugene Garcia & Christine Gutierrez.

CARD 100

- Keep applying research
- Keep the Faith!
- Keep Emphasis in cultural equity
- Keep developing the leadership
- Keep expanding & increasing parent involvement!

CARD 101

- Keep the parent education about their rights
- Keep teaching parents and educators to become strong advocates for their beliefs.
- Keep options of bilingual and dual immersion programs for parents
- Keep education districts, boards, and administrators that the law gives parent an option to keep bilingual education and they need to provide funds all their rights.
- Keep content based ELD
- Keep strengthening our bilingual programs in the state and dual immersion programs.
- Keep multicultural education

CARD 102

- Keep on educating the public on the value of learning two or more languages
- Keep on expanding dual language and FLES programs
- Keep on flaunting the data: dual lang/FLES program, produce higher achieving students.

CARD 103

- Keep supporting those who through the judicial process challenge school systems or states that vote and implement unproven methods as standard classroom practices for ELs.

Round 3:

What should we start doing in EL Education?

**What envisioned policies and practices would serve to ensure a quality education for ELs in the 21st century?
What ought to be initiated?**

CARD 1

- Promote 2nd language as an asset
- Align "high school graduation" with state standardized tests and track between high school drop-out and standardized test
- Use technology, esp social media to teach ES2 students

CARD 2

- Bring primary language assessment into the accountability
- Assessments (summative & formative) that are valid & reliable for use with English Learners
- Better ELD (comprehensive & effective) curriculum
- Teachers training at the college level to build on & improve on CLAD

CARD 3

- Inject a whole lot of integrity at all levels of education and policy making / implementing to focus all energies on the needs of the children
- To infuse education with the technologies currently used in general society

- Bring in more academic and service learning projects to bring relevance and context to learning
- To set standards high but leave solutions about how to accomplish theme to local control
- Broaden the ability of schools to use materials of their choice

CARD 4

- EL assessments that demonstrate growth over time
- Provide tier 1 instruction before interventions

CARD 5

- Dual language expansions
- Research on materials
- Research on Dual language - true bilingualism for all

CARD 6

- Be serious about teachers training and mentoring
- Do not let teachers alone help them work together and develop collaborative programs
- Incorporate research and integrate research with practice
- Improve ethical standards (in every aspect of education)
- Do not test so much - use formative testing and align a common core of standards
- New technology – The interment

CARD 7

- Keep on doing research on bilingual development, dual language programs, and bilingual special education
- Keep on giving opportunities to ELs including English class, AP Courses, etc.

CARD 8

- OELA needs to start intervening in states who through voter initiatives have implemented a decade of unproven methods as statewide practices that segregate EL students while producing continual failure

CARD 9

- We need to start having teachers involved in program curriculum, testing materials that would promote effective academic success in our students (ELL). Include our parents as well

CARD 10

- Meet students where they are in skill & technology and believe they hold promise teach to that
- Graduation as a given goal for all
- Coach teachers who don't have contemporary research based skills to differentiate instruction but also to evaluate what each student can do and need to be able to know in order to provide

CARD 11

- Bilingualism / Multilingualism supported at the national level
- FLAP grants available to any language program not only critical languages
- Invest more (\$) in education but have a higher level of monitoring
- Utilize STS results a part of school District evaluation not only CSTs
- Give some value to the CELDT. Giving a test in the summer / fall is already bad enough but districts finding out results next summer; that's shameful
- Give value to what we're doing or let's not do it. I know CELDT is in California but it's impacting a tremendous number of student
- Allow all students on dual language (SPN/ENG) programs to take the STS (Spanish test of Standards) not only ELs. Use data to evaluate programs

CARD 12

- We should start embracing the fact that knowing more than one language is an ASSET!
- We should work on helping student voices emerge
- We should strongly encourage educators to collaborate so as to never stop learning
- We should greatly increase funding for innovation that encourages the learning of effective English learner teaching strategies and techniques

CARD 13

- Develop future teachers before college ("Home Grown") and along with that change teacher prep programs to encourage candidates to engage with the communities in a deeper more meaningful way

- Use / promote mixed methodologies to do research and eval of programs
- Promote successful program in a way that is accessible to the general public so that the general public understands what becoming bilingual & proficient involves
- Give professionalism back to teachers. Trust their knowledge & experience as well as their ways of adjusting and delivering content rather than force them to stick to a script
- Develop curriculum that promotes higher cognitive development & academic advantage

CARD 14

- We should start HIGHLY MONITORING districts and their budgets
- We Should start mandating that research based best practices be utilized

CARD 15

- Have AYP disaggregated by EL (long term) learners and have schools be accountable for these students

CARD 16

- Federal standardization of identification and reclassification of EL students
- Borrow staff development models already available follow high expectations (depth & complexity)

CARD 17

- Inter-cultural schools, curriculum, communication
- Research-based “Best Practices” and repository
- Professional development model counting on teachers’ expertise and networking
- Emphasis on academic language
- Research-based policy advocacy
- High Expectations
- Collaboration on Higher –Ed / School
- Retention and success programs for youth (funded)
- Parent-School Programs (Funded)

CARD 18

- Developing teachers as leaders and include them in local state and national education policy development and decision making& monitoring of policy implementation
- Including EL students, both successful and unsuccessful, in policy making discussions
- Move compliance monitoring especially Title III down to the classroom level to truly see how funds are being used
- Move PD’s from “fixing teachers” to PLC teacher-based development building upon teachers’ expertise & experience to inform their practice
- Pass the DREAM Act and stop wasting the precious resources of our students

CARD 19

- Advocacy at state / legislative level, to change the CELDT testing
- We must have scores at the beginning of the year in order to utilize them effectively.
- It is ludicrous to defend to use of CELDT scores, when they are practically obsolete by the time we receive them
- Start utilizing multiple measure for showing progress for EL learners
- Informing teachers in Teacher Credentialing programs about EL issues. Don’t simply address language issues in context & culture we have to look at the huge differences within the subgroup of English learners

CARD 20

- We should start validating and working alongside Educators – teachers as professional and listening to their experiences and ideas about what is working what needs to change and How we can get there
- We should involve Educators in more Action Research and continue the collaboration with other researchers and administrators - looking at what is effective working with ELLs
- Support schools not cut down or tear down by removing teachers form the classroom & funding

CARD 21

- Educators, Student and Parents need to be involved in making policy at both the State and The National level – not just Politicians

- We need to realize that Change is not something that can occur in a few (3-4) years. We often throw out what works because we don't see immediate results

CARD 22

- Aligning Policy development that features student / teacher input and leadership

CARD 23

- Policy that ensure system reforms are integrated with larger general education reforms

CARD 24

- Treating teachers like professional
- Involving and students in policy decisions
- Allow time to ELs to acquire English
- Allow space such as this forum for teachers and students and parents voices to be heard

CARD 25

- Give control to local school districts and local schools to develop policies, teaching practices
- Involve parents & community in the schools (to a greater extent)
- Encourage teachers to learn about and become involved in the community where the teach
- Provide outreach and early childhood literacy in High-EL communities (Pre-School, Kindergarten)
- Emphasize native language literacy as a foundation for English as-a-second language literacy

CARD 26

- Monitoring implementation of EL programs
- Protect and increase funding for ELs
- Get involved with policy development and advocacy
- Address cultural proficiency in curriculum development and teacher education programs
- Include EL program focus in all administrative credentialing

CARD 27

- More transparency of EL programs – online directly of bilingual / dual language programs (CA)
- More transparency of ELACs (CA)
- Increase of student & teacher voices - commission
- Culturally & linguistically appropriate standards
- More rigid credentialing requirements

CARD 28

- Truly looking at our students needs and data, and realities – making sure curriculum aligns with those needs
- Professional development needs to include teachers & students
- Have appropriate interventions across the board
- Start looking at EL's at a deft more of a positive than negative
- Start including more multilingual programs
- Start cultural sensitivity – cultural relevancy program development
- Credentialing needs to be strengthened to include know how of ELL issues – both teachers and administrators – also make it a requirement for school members

CARD 29

- Funding Action Teaching Research
- Monitoring Title III funds
- Focusing on EL's in STEM activities (initiatives)

CARD 29

- Keep the research agenda
- Keep (and enhance) dual language programs
- Keep focus on LTEL
- Keep focus on (and enhance) professional development

CARD 31

- More funding for and recognition of successful dual immersion programs.
- Greater emphasis on academic language, starting with kids at ELD 1
- Higher expectations for all students, particularly for long-term ELL students
- A celebration of each student-s success; language acquisition is a process and every bit of progression toward it is a step in the right direction.

CARD 32

- Including voices of instructors and students.
- Change paradigm from helping students to cultivating potential
- Invest in technology
- Intergrate and collaborate within communities.

CARD 33

- Provide stipends for teachers of ELs
- Be more aggressive about bringing students/teachers/parents into these conversations
- Put a portfolio place to monitor students in the core areas, i.e., math, history, etc.
- Include language objectives in all content areas.

CARD 34

- Start doing is to have a data tracking system in place to keep track of the students in ELD levels throughout their school yrs. If we have a system in place designed specifically for ELL's there will be more monitoring in place.
- Start providing intervention for those students that are not progressing academically
- Have a consistent way to identified and exit students as ELL's.

CARD 35

- Higher expectations for students
- More formal/academic language in EL curriculum and assessments
- Same opportunities to learn for ELs as for mainstream students.

CARD 36

- We need to change the way we teach to adapt to 21st C. students.
- We need to start thinking of EL's as assets to schools instead of deficits and impact on the students the idea that they are great and can attain high levels of learning.
- When we talk @ equity, we should think of the equitable distribution of resources (be it technology, money for technology, state of the art schools).
- OELA should be more active in pressing for the passing of the DREAM ACT, this is the only way that all our students will have access to higher ed.

CARD 37

- Engage parents to be aware, & involved in the process. Too often they are not aware of what being an English Learner means, how to monitor progress in achieving proficiency, how to advocate for their children.
- We need to prepare ELs & all students to compete w/ a 21st century, so technology needs to be integrated successfully in EL models.
- Develop assessments that are valid & reliable for ELLs.

CARD 38

- College - train/educate to teach English learners
- Ongoing training
- Technology for our All
- Engaging students in their learning
- Engaging parents in their children's education
- Monitoring learning
- Focusing on student learning.

CARD 39

- Heavier emphasis on the use of technology by parents and students to bring down the technology divide.
- Connecting professional organizations so they can collaborate with each other on behalf of students
- More focus on content area expertise.

CARD 40

- Collaboration between disciplines
- Connection to STEM & ESL
- Identify & encourage ESL students in H.S. to enter teaching.

CARD 41

- Start with preschool language issues, look at school age language issues and what we expect students to know in High School and College. Language! We want students to speak a second language in order to graduate and be accepted to Universities but what do we support in Elementary/Preschool grades. We should look at supporting Dual Immersion for the benefit of this country & National Security

CARD 42

- Dual language programs in all campuses w/ more than 30% E.L. students.
- Increasing the # of days for quality professional development
- Track Long-term EL students.

CARD 43

- Providing access to extra assistance outside of the classroom for ELL students to help improve conversational fluency which has been shown to correlate with not only academic but also social success. If a student is able to speak up for themselves they can by being their own personal advocates and working alongside their peers to make sure they receive equal opportunities for education.

CARD 44

- Start to maximize the use of technology.
- assessment- develop assessments for ELs that are adaptive and responsive and give immediate feedback to guide instruction.
- instructional materials that make maximum use of video clips and language supports for high levels of concept development for EL.
- Start/continue research
- Start to require on-going recertification of teachers of ELs sure research is emerging - but be sure it is of quality and has collaboration, coaching, and peer work involved.

CARD 45

- Start...a national ELL assessments & standards like Common Core Standards.
- Prepare all students for high standards.
- Start having all teachers collaborate & work together.

CARD 46

- Teachers should be leaders, not outside consultants.
- Need to have special counselors.
- Need teachers who want to teach ESL.

CARD 47

- Do not offer parent involvement ever as a “may”!
- Focus on schools who are involving parents in a great way! We are making sure these schools articulate it well in their School Plans of St. Achievement - and then sharing those actions with weaker schools.

CARD 48

- Align common core standards w/ EL needs.
- Fund EL programs = special e. programs.
- Assess EL in content areas (in native lang.) to determine needs.

CARD 49

- Start to identify how Common Core Standards will identify what EL students should know, be able to do, and how well.
- Start an accurate assessment matrix that will use multiple measures to identify student growth & needs w/ regards to the acquisition of English.

CARD 50

- Consider saying “ELs & Anyone in Need of Language Development” because that’s what its all about...language development. I don’t like to hear people say “Oh, ESL, that’s just good teaching for everyone.” Yes, it is good teaching AND it’s about language development. If you ask, “who has ELs?” Some will say, “not I.” If you ask “who has students in need of language development?” you would hear “all of my students need language development.” By saying “ELs & Any-

one in Need of Language Development” the focus will stay on the need to improve academic language learning for all.

CARD 51

- Put Obama education on national agenda.

CARD 52

- Start looking at how to reduce dropout rates, identify & share in multiple ways
- Start promoting Dual language programs, include students, teachers, and directors.
- Start voicing concern - nationally about issues happening with other states.

CARD 53

- Start focusing on graduation rates
- Identify, share & implement successful program to decrease drop out rates.
- Train & prepare counselors to meet the needs to ELLs.
- Promote & fund dual lang programs & multilingual education.

CARD 54

- Re-think how we train counselors and other specialist to have an asset view of ELLs instead of deficit. Need to look at reviewing college eligibility, AP and Honors I/o focusing only on redesignation.
- Reviewing how we provide curriculum to EL?

CARD 55

- Identify, Share, & Implement successful programs that decreased the Drop out Rate.
- Identify, Share, & Implement Effective AP Programs that support H.S. ELLs
- Restructure/Revamp teacher preparation at both Community College and 4/5 year tchr preparation.
- Impelement collaborative comprehensive & long term professional development 3-5 yrs action tchng/lrng research that focus on our students across the curriculum

CARD 56

- Expand & fund more dual language programs and add a 3rd language - Global
- Fund & Expand the integration of technology across public schooling preschool - 12th grade. Invest in the creation of innovative software.
- We have to stop making bad policies regarding ELLs.

CARD 57

- We need to pass the DREAM Act.

CARD 58

- Begin initiatives that support the development of support systems for future bilingual teachers beginning at early identification of H.S. students.
- Make multilingual programs the mainstream not the exception - build programs where the resources are available and can be successful.
- Have forums for legislators and policymakers where they have access to effective programs and visits to these programs
- Maintain programs for parental engagement that are tied to student achievement and build Family, School, community partnerships.
- Look to ways to “individualize” prof dev. Through school wide efforts to implement best practices and where everyone understands the programs components and are working to the most effective implementation of those programs - shared responsibility.

CARD 59

- Implement educ programs that include multiple languages K-12 - programs like Malia & Sasha Obama are attending
- Fund dual/multiple language programs - Judy Chu’s GLEA
- Require dual/multiple language & multicultural education strategies for school leader (principal) & teacher certification
- Add multiple measures to assessment practices
- Recognize strengths of EL students & families.

CARD 60

- Once goals are agreed on - clearly articulated - need accurate & authentic assessment.

- Once assessment is in place - gaps in the system will be revealed - and can be targets of professional development.
- Decide on what the goals of EL Education should be: Broad goals - English proficiency but also other desired outcomes incl: multiculturalism, Social justice/equity outlook, Multilingualism (L1 & L2 and L3)

CARD 61

- Share, successful, programs to decrease drop out rate...
- Prepare counselors to be knowledgeable to meet ELLs needs.
- Re-vamp Education System we don't fit this cookie cutter mold.

CARD 62

- Looking at where we are, where are students are, how are we teaching them, what education are we providing, what core/instructional materials are we using and where do we go from there.

CARD 63

- Every student graduates proficient in English in one or more languages
- All students have access to a full curriculum to be able to problem solve, think creatively, communicate & do research.
- Schools & districts fully funded to provide collaborative time to plan & for professional development.
- New ELP exams (funding at a sufficient level for development) National ELP Standards aligned to Common Core.
- National Seal & Biliteracy to recognize high school graduates proficient in English and one or more languages.

CARD 64

- Continue to support and push for the national seal of Biliteracy
- More monitoring that Title 3 actually gets to professional development for teachers and principals and into the hands of ELL learner where it is not happening in many districts.
- Ensure that all students in California are proficient in English and a second language.
- Ensure that all students have content based ELD for at least one hour, where now it is not happening.

CARD 65

- Full & Balanced Curriculum that includes consistent & continuous teaching of science, social studies, etc.
- Opportunities to interact with trade books.
- Recognize that teaching EL is rocket science and that it requires long-term PD to develop best practices in depth & time to place with a clear focus on sheltering
- Curriculum especially developed for ELL in the lower grades to emphasize oral language development, academic language development and critical thinking skills
- Teaching of both L1 and L2
- Curriculum (ELA) that applies best research for ELLs.

CARD 66

- Research into the intricacy of teaching EL students.
- Prepare professional and paraprofessionals in those intricacies
- Parent and community involvement.

CARD 67

- Start an alignment of ESL standard to common core standards.
- Challenge all students to become bilingual.

CARD 68

- Addressing sociocultural issues (e.g. racism, xenophobia, immigration, poverty, housing, health) which are often detrimental to the educational outcomes of EL students.

CARD 69

- Develop a consistent process to identify a student as an ELL within and across states.
- Develop national English Language Proficiency standards and a national definition of English Language Proficiency.
- Requiring training to teach ELLs for all teachers with ELLs in the classroom.

- Requiring principals, administrators who have significant #'s of ELLs in their schools to have training and/or experience working with ELLs.
- Teaching literacy in ELLs first language and placing value on their first language.
- Researching and addressing the needs of ELLs with disabilities appropriately.
- Research and develop ELL programs that approach English Language development from a 2nd dialect approach for native Americans and other non-standard English speakers
- Develop and Implement Highly qualified “standards” for ELL teachers and administrators.

CARD 70

- Approaching ELL issues with a distinction between services in urban vs. rural settings.
- Having policy & law makers be required to seek input from practitioners and students before developing policy or drafting legislation.
- Using technology in ways that is more sensitive to ELLs.

CARD 71

- Create structures & processes for incorporating student & teacher voices into decision-making
- Practice professional development as an additive process for teachers & administrators.
- Align ELP standards & assessment.
- Raise the bar/high expectation through access & scaffolded, tiered support for learning.

CARD 72

- To meet EL needs in the design and implementation of tools & equipment for 21st century skills.

CARD 73

- Focus on leadership training. If leaders are not skilled in dual language instruction, how can they support their teachers.
- Implement what works! Especially when it's hard (we KNOW what works - Do It!)
- Recognizing that all language learners are not the same. Focus on each student as a person rather than a collective sub-group
- Critical thinking for ELL's - critical thinking has nothing to do with language.

CARD 74

- Continue to keep the conversation flowing between all branches, arms, etc connected to kids. I cant tell you how impressed I am that different departments within USDE actually work together.

CARD 75

- Improve dialogue between students, teachers, & parents
- Looking at data & discussing the data to ensure certain students are acknowledged.
- Develop technology for all students to access & use
- All students need to have access to all learning opportunities.

CARD 76

- Multilingual programs - expansion
- English language development through Science/Social Studies.
- Increase access to preschool
- Implementation of bilingual pro-schools
- Include Spanish assessments in California accountability system
- Create mentorship's for students that will pipeline them into high ed, etc.

CARD 77

- Integrate ESL/EL into mainstream classes.

CARD 78

- Teach EL students all subject areas - science & social studies too.
- Create specialized programs for ELs not reclassifying before end of elementary school and entering middle school.

CARD 79

- We need to start including parents and their students in the conversations about how to best service the needs to EL students. Also include EL students that have gone through the system. Find out what helped/hindered them. What would they change? What would they continue?

CARD 80

- Less student per teacher ratio.
- Better transition plans from being re-designated to entering English only classrooms.

- Plan to provide rigor so that EL students access 21st century.
- Use Equity Score card to generate information and statistics to generate focused discussion.

CARD 81

- Start ensuring that recently exited students are fluent in Eng. So they can achieve at the same rate as native speaking peers.
- Possibly allow Title III funding to support recently exited students - additional supplemental services before/after school (tutoring)
- Start looking at accountability measures for title III - AMAO 3 - How can a 1st year pre-emergent student meet AYP for math/reading.

CARD 82

- Focusing Professional Development on DEVELOPMENT! Action, Teaching, Learning, Research.
- Supporting agencies CAFE, OELA, CALSA, etc.
- Intervention for after re-classification
- Validating culture and language
- Getting educators & students involved in policy - align CLSS to ELP standards.

CARD 83

- Start having deep conversation about the curriculum we are using for English learners. Discuss purpose of CST in SPANISH if we are not using for AMAO's or school reform.

CARD 84

- Are needs of ELL's being reflected in curriculum?
- Cultural literacy needs of ELL's need to be addressed
- Advocate for research-based policies of local, state, & federal level

CARD 85

- Research base, evidence of success, Inst practices
- Successful programs i.e. dual language etc.
- Growth model
- Keep ELs at the core of conversations, decisions, policy, & teacher / principal evaluation
- Keep advocate for equity

CARD 86

- Doing a better job setting the Agenda for ELL's at the national level
- Putting research into practice
- Expect high standards for EL's with a well rounded curriculum (all subjects)
- Putting more into system for EL's
- Including 21st century skills in curriculum information literacy, integrated teaching, creativity, communication skills, multiple languages

CARD 87

- We need to address the whole child as we educate children
- Start to question things hasn't work for year like state curriculum when 80% of our students are in need of intervention

CARD 88

- We need to become advocates for participation in the assessment(s) for CCSS
- We need to be at this table so that ELL concern, needs are addressed.
- The issue of linguistics modification and academic English language need to be a part of the CCSS assessment piece